

VALERIO DE OLIVEIRA MAZZUOLI

THE LAW OF TREATIES

A COMPREHENSIVE STUDY OF THE 1969
VIENNA CONVENTION AND BEYOND

Foreword

PAULO PINTO DE ALBUQUERQUE

Judge of the European Court of Human Rights



- EDITORA FORENSE is responsible for any flaws that its products may have concerning their edition (i.e., their printing and presentation, enabling the consumer to handle and read them without issue). Neither the publisher nor the author assumes any possible responsibility or liability for any damage or loss sustained by any person or property that might arise from the use of this work.

All rights reserved. In accordance with the provisions of the copyright legislation, total or partial reproduction of any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, is prohibited, including by xerographic processes, photocopying and recording, without prior permission in written form from the author and the publisher.

Printed in Brazil

- English translation of the 2nd Brazilian edition by Diego Luis Alonso
Exclusive rights protected in Brazil concerning the English language version
Copyright © 2016 by

EDITORIA FORENSE LTDA.

A publishing house part of GEN | Grupo Editorial Nacional

Travessa do Ouvidor, 11 – CEP: 20040-040 – Rio de Janeiro – RJ (Brazil)

Phone: +55 (21) 3543-0770 – Fax: +55 (21) 3543-0896

faleconosco@grupogen.com.br | www.grupogen.com.br

- Any owner of rights whose work is fraudulently reproduced, disseminated or used in any other way may apply for the seizure of the copies or the suspension of their dissemination, without prejudice to whatever indemnification that may be applicable (Section 102 of Act no. 9610, 19.02.1998). Any person who, for the purposes of sale or securing any direct or indirect gains, advantages or profits for herself/himself or for a third party, sells, displays for sale, receives and conceals, acquires, distributes, stores or uses a fraudulently reproduced work or phonogram shall be severally liable along with the infringer in accordance with the provisions of foregoing Sections; in the event the reproduction has been carried out abroad, the importer and the distributor shall be held accountable for such an infringement (Section 104, Act no. 9.610/98).
- Book cover: Danilo Oliveira
- Cataloging in publication (CIP) – Brazil.
Sindicato Nacional dos Editores de Livros (Brazilian Union of Publishers), Rio de Janeiro (RJ) – Brazil.

M429L

Mazzuoli, Valério de Oliveira, 1977-

The law of treaties: a comprehensive study of the 1969 Vienna convention and beyond / Valério de Oliveira Mazzuoli; [Translation by Diego Luis Alonso]; foreword Paulo Pinto de Albuquerque – Rio de Janeiro: Forense, 2016.

Original title: *Direito dos Tratados*

Text in English

Includes Bibliography

ISBN 978-85-309-5686-8

1. Public International Law. I. Title.

15-27260

CDU: 341.9

Summary

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS USED.....	XIX
INTRODUCTION.....	XXI

PART I

GENERAL THEORY OF TREATIES

Chapter 1

CONCEPT OF INTERNATIONAL TREATY

1.1 Historical background.....	3
1.2 Codification of the law of treaties.....	6
1.3 The Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties.....	10
1.4 Concept of treaty.....	16
1.4.1 International agreement.....	18
1.4.2 Concluded in written form.....	20
1.4.3 Concluded between States or international organizations.....	22
1.4.4 Governed by international law.....	25
1.4.5 Whether embodied in a single instrument or in two or more related instruments.....	26
1.4.6 Absence of a particular designation.....	27
1.5 Treaty terminology.....	28
1.6 The issue of Memoranda of Understanding (MOUs).....	41
1.7 Soft law instruments.....	48

Chapter 2

CLASSIFICATION OF TREATIES

2.1 Formal classifications.....	53
2.1.1 Considerations regarding the number of parties.....	54
2.1.2 Considerations regarding the type of procedure for their conclusion.....	57
2.1.3 Considerations concerning the possibility to access to a treaty.....	60
2.2 Material classifications.....	61
2.2.1 Considerations concerning the legal nature.....	62
2.2.2 Considerations concerning implementation over time.....	66

2.2.3	Consideration concerning territorial implementation	67
2.2.4	Considerations concerning the implementation mechanism	68
2.3	Plan of the following parts of this work	69

PART II

GENESIS OF INTERNATIONAL TREATIES

Chapter 1

PROCEDURE OF FORMATION AND CONCLUSION OF TREATIES

1.1	Introduction	73
1.2	International and internal stages	74
1.3	Conditions of validity	75
1.3.1	Capacity of negotiating States	76
1.3.2	Signatories authorization and full powers	80
1.3.3	Mutual consent	86
1.3.4	Lawfulness and material possibility of object or purpose	87
1.4	Preparation of the conventional text	88
1.4.1	Negotiations	89
1.4.1.1	Distinction regarding the type of treaty	90
1.4.1.2	Procedure followed in international organizations or <i>ad hoc</i> international conferences	92
1.4.1.3	General rule of good faith negotiations	93
1.4.2	Adoption of the text	94
1.4.2.1	Rules for the adoption of the text	95
1.4.2.2	Differentiations	96
1.4.2.3	Full powers for adoption	97
1.4.3	Authentication	98
1.5	Expression of consent	102
1.5.1	Signature	104
1.5.1.1	Concept	105
1.5.1.2	Legal nature	105
1.5.1.3	Full powers upon signature	107
1.5.1.4	Signature with ratification effect	109
1.5.1.5	Deferred signature	112
1.5.1.6	Obligations arising from signature	113
1.5.2	Ratification	118
1.5.2.1	Concept	121
1.5.2.2	Legal nature	123
1.5.2.3	Silent treaties	125

1.5.2.4	Procedure	127
1.5.2.5	Characteristics	130
1.5.2.5.1	Governmental act of international nature	131
1.5.2.5.2	Express act	133
1.5.2.5.3	Political and circumstantial act	134
1.5.2.5.4	Discretionary act	135
1.5.2.5.5	Act of non-retroactive nature	138
1.5.2.5.6	Irrevocable act	139
1.5.2.5.7	No time limits	139
1.5.2.5.8	Possibility or impossibility of carrying out a conditional ratification	141
1.5.3	Accession	141
1.6	Structure of treaties	146

Chapter 2

RESERVATIONS TO MULTILATERAL TREATIES

2.1	Introduction	151
2.2	Reservations to bilateral treaties?	154
2.3	Concept and formulation of reservations	156
2.4	Moment of formulation of reservations	160
2.5	Limitations on reservations	163
2.6	Procedure regarding reservations	173
2.7	Distinction between reservations and other acts not implying a reservation	176
2.8	Acceptance of and objection to reservations	182
2.9	Effects of reservations	188
2.10	Withdrawal of reservations or objections	189
2.11	Interpretation of reservations	192
2.12	The problem of reservations (and amendments) at the internal level	193
2.13	Addendum: consideration of the matter of reservations and interpretative declarations in case of succession of States	196

Chapter 3

ENTRY INTO FORCE OF TREATIES

3.1	Entry into force and provisional application of treaties	199
3.1.1	Entry into force of treaties	199
3.1.2	Provisional application of treaties	203
3.2	Registration and publication of treaties	206
3.3	Observance and application of treaties	210
3.3.1	Observance (or compliance) of treaties	210

3.3.2	Application of treaties.....	218
3.3.2.1	Temporal scope of application.....	219
3.3.2.2	Territorial scope of application.....	221
3.4	Effectiveness of treaties and international responsibility.....	223

PART III

CONTINUANCE IN FORCE AND TERMINATION OF TREATIES

Chapter 1

TREATIES IN FORCE

1.1	Effects of treaties on the parties.....	229
1.1.1	External effects.....	230
1.1.2	Internal effects	231
1.2	Effects of treaties on third parties	233
1.2.1	Diffuse effect of recognizing an objective legal situation.....	234
1.2.2	Factual impact of a given treaty on third States.....	236
1.2.3	Legal effect of imposing obligations and granting rights to third States.....	238
1.2.3.1	Treaties providing for obligations for third States	239
1.2.3.2	Treaties providing for rights for third States.....	241
1.3	Effects of treaties that have not yet entered into force on contracting parties and third parties	245
1.4	Amendment and modification of treaties	246
1.4.1	Amendment of treaties	246
1.4.2	Modification of multilateral treaties	251
1.4.3	Internal law procedure.....	255
1.5	Interpretation of treaties.....	256
1.5.1	General interpretation rule	257
1.5.2	Supplementary means of interpretation.....	262
1.5.3	Interpretation of treaties authenticated in two or more languages.....	266
1.5.4	Interpretation systems.....	268
1.5.4.1	International interpretation	269
1.5.4.2	Internal interpretation	272
1.5.4.3	Interpretation by legal scholars	274
1.5.5	Interpretation of treaties on human rights.....	274
1.6	Conflict between successive treaties	275
1.6.1	Prevalence of the UN Charter and norms of <i>jus cogens</i>	278
1.6.2	The problem of compatibility clauses	279
1.6.3	Successive treaties relating to the same subject-matter with identical parties.....	282

1.6.4	Successive treaties relating to the same subject-matter with different parties.....	284
1.6.5	Conclusion on the Convention system.....	285
1.7	Concurrence of treaties with a later customary rule	286

Chapter 2

DEFECTS IN CONSENT AND IN INTERNATIONAL ACTS

2.1	Defects in consent and invalidity of treaties	290
2.1.1	Avoidability of consent	292
2.1.1.1	Error.....	293
2.1.1.2	Fraud.....	295
2.1.1.3	Corruption of a representative of a State.....	296
2.1.2	Invalidity of consent.....	297
2.1.3	Invalidity of treaties.....	300
2.2	<i>Jus cogens</i> and invalidity of treaties	305
2.2.1	What are norms of <i>jus cogens</i> ?	307
2.2.2	Conflict between treaties and norms of <i>jus cogens</i>	312
2.2.2.1	Conflict between a treaty and an earlier norm of <i>jus cogens</i>	312
2.2.2.2	Conflict between a treaty and a subsequent norm of <i>jus cogens</i>	314
2.2.2.3	Conflict between a treaty and a norm of <i>jus cogens</i> existing before entry into force of the Vienna Convention.....	317
2.2.3	Hierarchy of norms of <i>jus cogens</i> in the law of treaties.....	318
2.3	Unconstitutionality of treaties	319
2.3.1	Constitutional approach	320
2.3.2	International approach	322
2.3.3	Conciliatory approach.....	323
2.3.4	Solution adopted by the 1969 Vienna Convention	324
2.3.5	Intrinsic unconstitutionality of treaties	330

Chapter 3

TERMINATION AND SUSPENSION OF TREATIES

3.1	Termination of treaties.....	336
3.1.1	Termination by consent of the parties	336
3.1.1.1	Predetermined abrogation	337
3.1.1.1.1	Expiration of the agreed term	337
3.1.1.1.2	Condition subsequent	338
3.1.1.1.3	Full performance of treaty object and purpose.....	339
3.1.1.2	Supervening abrogation	340

3.1.1.2.1	Termination by the vote of a given number of parties.....	341
3.1.1.2.2	(Implicit or tacit) Termination by a later treaty.....	342
3.1.2	Termination by unilateral will (denunciation)	343
3.1.2.1	Denunciation in the 1969 Vienna Convention	344
3.1.2.2	The problem of denunciation in Brazilian Law	348
3.1.3	Extrinsic grounds for termination	356
3.1.3.1	Material breach of a treaty	357
3.1.3.2	Supervening impossibility of performance.....	361
3.1.3.3	Fundamental change of circumstances	364
3.1.3.4	Severance of diplomatic or consular relations.....	369
3.1.3.5	State of war.....	370
3.1.3.6	Disuse (obsolete)	372
3.2	Suspension of the operation of treaties.....	373
3.2.1	Suspension by the agreement of the parties.....	374
3.2.2	Suspension by unilateral will	375
3.2.3	Extrinsic grounds for suspension.....	376
3.2.4	Suspension of treaties and the Brazilian Law.....	377

Chapter 4

PROCEDURE TO BE FOLLOWED WITH RESPECT TO DEFECTS, INVALIDITY, TERMINATION OR SUSPENSION

4.1	Procedure relating to defects in consent, invalidity, termination, withdrawal or suspension of the operation of a treaty.....	379
4.1.1	Procedure under the 1969 Vienna Convention.....	380
4.1.2	Particularities of the 1986 Vienna Convention	386
4.2	Consequences of vitiated consent, invalidity, termination and suspension of the operation of a treaty.....	388
4.2.1	Consequences of invalidity of a treaty and vitiated consent.....	389
4.2.2	Consequences of the termination of a treaty	390
4.2.3	Consequences of the suspension of the operation of a treaty.....	392

PART IV

TREATIES IN THE 1986 VIENNA CONVENTION

Chapter 1

GENERAL RULES OF THE 1986 CONVENTION

1.1	Introduction.....	397
1.2	History and current situation of the 1986 Convention	398

1.3	Similarities between the 1969 and 1986 Conventions.....	400
1.4	Relationship between the 1986 Convention and the 1969 Convention.....	402
1.5	Situation of the Vienna Convention of 1986 in Brazil.....	404

Chapter 2

TREATIES UNDER THE CONVENTION OF 1986

2.1	Capacity of international organizations to conclude treaties	405
2.2	Some treaties included in the 1986 Convention.....	406
2.2.1	Headquarters agreements.....	406
2.2.2	Agreements on privileges and immunities.....	407
2.2.3	Agreements for the creation of bodies related to the organization in States.....	407
2.2.4	Agreements to organize meetings and promote cooperation between international organizations	408
2.2.5	Agreements to give conferences of international organizations in States.....	408
2.3	Questions not prejudged by the 1986 Convention	408

PART V

TREATIES AND INTERNAL LAW

Chapter 1

CONSTITUTIONAL PROCEDURAL ASPECTS ON THE CONCLUSION OF TREATIES IN BRAZIL

1.1	Introduction.....	413
1.2	The 1988 Brazilian Constitution and the treaty-making power	417
1.3	The issue of treaties concluded in simplified form	418
1.4	The relationship between the Executive Power and Legislative Power in the treaty-making process.....	427
1.5	The role of the National Congress in the treaty-making process.....	435
1.5.1	The expression “decide definitively” used in the Constitution	436
1.5.2	The question of “charges or commitments encumbering the national patrimony”	440
1.6	Internal procedure in the Houses of the National Congress	443
1.7	Brazilian practice for the entry into force of treaties	446
1.7.1	Final agreement and deposit.....	446
1.7.2	Promulgation	449
1.7.3	Publication.....	457
1.8	Effects of the internal adoption of treaties in the national legal system.....	460
1.9	Public authorities responsible for the execution of treaties	461

Chapter 2

CONFLICT BETWEEN TREATIES AND RULES OF INTERNAL LAW

2.1	The case of Brazil.....	463
2.2	Regulatory parity of ordinary treaties declared by the SFC.....	466
2.3	Our opinion as to the position of the SFC.....	472
2.4	Jurisdictional control of the conventionality of laws.....	478
	2.4.1 The doctrine of conventionality control in the Inter-American system	480
	2.4.2 Conventionality control in Brazilian Law.....	484
	2.4.2.1 Concentrated control of conventionality.....	485
	2.4.2.2 Diffuse control of conventionality.....	488
	2.4.3 Control of supralegality.....	490
2.5	Some sensitive issues on the application of treaties in Brazil.....	492
	REFERENCES.....	495

ANNEXES

Annex I

Havana Convention on Treaties (1928).....	517
---	-----

Annex II

Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (1969).....	521
--	-----

Annex III

Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties between States and International Organizations or between International Organizations (1986).....	547
--	-----

Annex IV

Official Status of the 1969 Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties.....	581
---	-----

Annex V

Guide to Practice on Reservations to Treaties (2011).....	615
---	-----

LIST OF OTHER PUBLISHED WORKS OF THE AUTHOR.....	645
--	-----