

# **Environmental Democracy and Law**

Public Participation in Europe

Edited by Gyula Bándi

The Avosetta Series (11)



Europa Law Publishing is a publishing company specializing in European Union law, international trade law, public international law, environmental law and comparative national law.

For further information please contact Europa Law Publishing via email: [info@europalawpublishing.com](mailto:info@europalawpublishing.com) or visit our website at: [www.europalawpublishing.com](http://www.europalawpublishing.com).

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted, in any form or by any means, or stored in any retrieval system of any nature, without the written permission of the publisher. Application for permission for use of copyright material shall be made to the publishers. Full acknowledgement of author, publisher and source must be given.

Voor zover het maken van kopieën uit deze uitgave is toegestaan op grond van artikel 16h t/m 16m Auteurswet 1912 *juncto* het Besluit van 27 november 2002, Stb. 575, dient men de daarvoor wettelijk verschuldigde vergoedingen te voldoen aan de Stichting Reprorecht (Postbus 3060, 2130 KB Hoofddorp). Voor het overnemen van (een) gedeelte(n) uit deze uitgave in bloemlezingen, readers en andere compilatiewerken (artikel 16 Auteurswet 1912) dient men zich tot de uitgever te wenden.

© Europa Law Publishing, the authors severally, 2014

Typeset in Scala and Scala Sans, Graphic design by G2K Designers, Groningen/Amsterdam

NUR 828; ISBN 978-90-8952-149-1

This project has been funded with support from the European Commission. This publication reflects the views only of the authors, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.



Lifelong  
Learning  
Programme

The Avosetta Series publishes texts that present innovative discourse on European Environmental Law.

## CONTENTS

	<i>Preface</i>	v
	<i>Contents</i>	vii
	<i>Authors</i>	xvi
CHAPTER 1	<b>Introduction into the Concept of 'Environmental Democracy'</b> Gyula Bándi	
1	The Definition of Environmental Democracy and its Constituents	3
2	The Collective or 'Community' Dimension	8
3	Common Concern of Humanity	9
4	Common Heritage	11
5	Common Good	13
6	Subsidiarity	14
7	Environmental Justice	16
8	Different Practical Rationales of Public Participation	18
CHAPTER 2	<b>Theoretical Foundations of Public Participation in Administrative Decision-Making</b> Gerd Winter	
1	Problems of Public Participation	23
2	Theoretical Backgrounds for Public Participation	25
3	Choosing a Theory and Deriving Solutions for Public Participation	30
4	Denationalisation of Administrative Decision-Making and Public Participation	32
4.1	Participation in EU Administrative Procedures	32
4.2	International and Transnational Spheres	33
CHAPTER 3	<b>The Three Pillars of Environmental Democracy in a European Perspective</b> Gyula Bándi	
1	European Environmental Policy and Environmental Democracy	39
2	European Legislation and Jurisdiction – A Demonstration	45
3	Participation in Decision-Making	55
4	Access to Justice	61

CHAPTER 4	<b>Right to Environment – Procedural Guarantees</b> Gyula Bándi	
1	Right to Environment – Procedural Guarantees	79
2	Summary	93
CHAPTER 5	<b>Public Participation – Human Right or an Instrument of International Administrative Law</b> Marcel Szabó	
1	Historical and International Law Origins of Public Participation	97
2	The Direct Antecedents of the International Rules on Public Participation	98
3	Theoretical Issues Related to the International Rules of Public Participation	101
3.1	Public Participation is One of the Cornerstones of International Human Rights	102
4	The Current Best Practices of Public Participation and their Critique	103
4.1	The Union Implementation of the Aarhus Convention – Strengths and Weaknesses	103
4.2	The North-American Agreement on Environmental Cooperation (NAAEC)	105
4.3	The Rules of Public Participation in Other Parts of the World	106
5	The Way Forward: Transboundary Public Participation	108
5.1	The Possibilities of Private Persons for Transnational Public Participation	108
5.1.1	Private Litigation	108
5.1.2	Civil Participation in Consultative Bodies	109
5.1.3	Civil Action Related to the Financing Activity of Banks	109
6	En Route to Implementation of International Agreements on Environmental Protection and the Enforcement of International Environmental Law	110
6.1	Participation of NGOs in the Implementation of International Conventions	110
6.3	Environmental Civil Society Organisations Before the Courts: <i>Amicus Curiae</i> Briefs	111
7	Conclusion	112

CHAPTER 6	<b>Public Participation under Article 6 of the Aarhus Convention. Role in Tiered Decision-Making and Scope of Application</b> Jerzy Jendrośka	
1	Article 6 and its Role in the Second Pillar of the Convention	115
2	Decisions under Article 6 and Decisions under Articles 7 and 8 of the Convention	116
3	The Requirement for “Early Public Participation”, the Concept of Tiered Decision-Making and the “Zero” Option	118
4	Legal Nature of Decisions under Article 6	122
5	Application of Article 6 to Multiple Decision-Making	124
6	Activities Covered by Article 6(1)(a)	131
7	Activities Covered by Article 6(1)(b)	132
8	Reconsiderations and Updates under Article 6 Paragraph 10	135
CHAPTER 7	<b>Implementation of Public Participation Principles. Experience of the EU</b> Eva Kružíková	
1	Introduction	141
2	EU Implementing Measures	141
2.1	Access to Information (First Pillar)	142
2.2	Access to Justice (Third Pillar)	144
3	Regulation 1367/2006 (Aarhus Regulation), Title IV	149
CHAPTER 8	<b>Clarification and Networking. Methodology for an Institution Representing Future Generations</b> Sándor Fülöp	
1	Introduction	155
2	The Challenges	156
3	The Real Challenges	158
4	Experiences of the Hungarian FG Institution	161
5	Experiences that Could be Generalised	165
6	Law as a Tool in the Hands of the Future Generations	171
CHAPTER 9	<b>Problems and Questions of Public Interest Environmental Litigation in Hungary and in the EU</b> Csaba Kiss	
1	Definition of the Topic Area	175
1.1	What are these Layers or Fields?	175

1.2	What is the Essence of Public Interest Litigation in Environmental Matters?	176
1.3	What are the Public Interest Cases?	176
2	Pros and Cons of Public Interest Environmental Litigation	177
3	Conditions of Public Interest Litigation	179
3.1	Legal Barriers	179
3.1.1	Lack of Forum	179
3.1.2	Restrictive Legal Standing Criteria	180
3.1.3	Difficult or Inefficient Injunctive Relief	180
3.2	Practical Barriers	181
3.2.1	Lack of Timely Judicial Decisions	181
3.2.2	Costs of Judicial Proceedings	181
3.2.3	Lack of Free Legal Aid	183
4	Legal Standing Criteria for Public Interest Environmental Litigation by NGOs in Selected EU Member States	183
5	Conclusion	186
6	Future Prospects	188
CHAPTER 10	<b>Public Participation in Environmental Decision-Making in Ireland. The Good, the Bad and the Ugly</b> Yvonne Scannell	
1	Public Participation in Land Use Planning Law	193
2	Public Participation in Decision-Making on Applications for Permissions to Develop Land	196
3	Experiences with Public Participation in EPA Decisions on IPPC Licences	203
4	The <i>Actio Popularis</i> in Planning Legislation	205
5	Enforcement of IPPC and Waste Legislation	207
6	Judicial Review of Planning Decisions	209
7	Conclusions	215
CHAPTER 11	<b>National Defence vs. Environmental Protection. The Saga of a Radar Station in Hungary</b> Attila Pánovics	
1	Introduction	221
2	Preliminaries	222
3	The “Battle of Zengő”	223
4	The Ombudsman’s Report	224
5	The Activity of the “Zengő Committee”	226
6	Effects of the Accession to the European Union	228
7	New Location: The Tubes	229
8	Solution to the Case	231
9	Conclusions	231

CHAPTER 12	<b>Promoting Public Participation beyond the EU. The Road to Environmental Democracy</b> Marta Szigeti Bonifert	237
CHAPTER 13	<b>Participation and Indifference. The State of Social Participation in Hungary</b> Benedek Jávor & Zsolt Beke	
1	The Institutional Side	244
2	Social Needs and Capabilities	245
3	Research Methodology and Database	246
3.1	Results	247
4	The Impact of the Place of Residence on Participation	251
5	Education and Participation	255
6	Conclusion	264
	Appendix	268
CHAPTER 14	<b>The Hungarian Parliamentary Commissioner for Future Generations</b> István Sárközy	
1	Establishment of the Office of the Hungarian Parliamentary Commissioner for Future Generations	273
2	Impact of the Parliamentary Commissioner for Future Generations	274
3	Independence and Long-Term Vision	275
4	Competences of the Parliamentary Commissioner for Future Generations	275
4.1	Competences Determined by Law	277
5	Activities and the Impact of the Commissioner	278
5.1	Investigation	278
5.1.1	Recommendations	280
5.1.2	Measures of Direct Legal Effect	280
5.2	Policy Advocacy	280
5.3	Strategy and Research	281
6	Map of Environmental Conflicts – Examples from the Cases of the Commissioner's Practice	282
6.1	Municipal Spatial Planning	283
6.2	Protection Against Noise	284
6.3	Air Protection	284
6.4	Water Protection	285
6.5	Nature Conservation	286
6.6	Traffic	287
6.7	Energy Production	287

6.8	Waste Management	288
6.9	Animal Husbandry	289
6.10	Public Participation	289
7	International Relations, Activities	290
7.1	Participation in Decision-Making on European Union Issues	291
7.2	Activities Aimed at Following the Enforcement of International Treaties	291
7.3	Cooperation with Prominent Partners	292
7.4	Participation at the Rio+20 Summit	292
8	Conferences and Appearance in the Media	293
9	The Transformation of the Hungarian Ombudsman System, the Fundamental Law of Hungary and the New Ombudsman Act	293
9.1	Drafting of the Fundamental Law and its Provisions in Connection with the Right to a Healthy Environment	293
9.2	Activity in the Press Related to the Drafting of the Constitution	296
9.3	Reflections on the FGO's Proposals	296
9.4	The Commissioner at the Parliament's Plenary Session	297
10	Analysis of the Fundamental Law and its Comparison with the Former Constitution	297
10.1	The New Ombudsman Act and the Fundamental Law	299
11	Conclusions	303

## CHAPTER 15 **Public Participation in GMO Regulation**

Ágnes Kovács

1	Global Effect	307
2	Principle of Public Participation	308
3	Public Participation as Regulated by Law	309
3.1	Public Participation in International Law	309
3.1.1	Convention on Biological Diversity	309
3.1.2	Cartagena Protocol	310
3.1.3	Aarhus Convention	312
3.1.4	Nagoya Protocol	313
3.2	EU Legislation	314
3.2.1	Policy Making	314
3.2.2	Directive 2001/18	316
3.2.3	Regulation 1829/2003	317
3.3	Legislation at National Level	317
4	Informal Public Participation	318
4.1	The Role of NGO's	318



4.2	Public Protest	319
5	Summary – Negative Effects on Public Participation	320
<b>CHAPTER 16</b>	<b>Public Participation in Waste Legislation of the EU</b> Szilvia Szilágyi	
1	Foreword	325
2	The EU's Thematic Strategy on the Prevention and Recycling of Waste	326
3	Framework Legislation on Waste and Waste Treatment Operations	327
3.1	Shipment of Waste	327
3.2	Waste Incineration	328
3.3	The Waste Framework Directive	329
4	Directives on Waste Streams	330
4.1	Batteries	330
4.2	Waste of Electrical and Electronic Equipments	331
4.3	End of Life Vehicles (ELV)	332
4.4	Mining Waste	332
4.5	Packaging Waste	335
5	Case Law of the Court of Justice of the European Union	336
5.1	Case C-416/10	336
5.2	Case C-255/05	338
6	Summary	340
<b>CHAPTER 17</b>	<b>Public Participation in European Energy Utilization</b> András Lovas	
1	Introduction	343
2	Public Participation Trends in Energy Issues	343
2.1	Nuclear Energy	345
2.2	Renewable Energy	347
2.3	Carbon Capture and Storage and Unconventional Natural Gas	349
3	Conclusion	352
	<i>Bibliography</i>	354
	<i>Table of Cases</i>	374
	<i>Table of Legislation and Other Regulatory Instruments</i>	382