

Comparative Law

MATHIAS SIEMS

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521177177

© Mathias Siems 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by CPI Group Ltd, Croydon CR0 4YY

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-107-00375-0 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-17717-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

List of tables	<i>page</i> xiv
List of figures	xv
Preface	xvii
List of abbreviations	xix
1 Introduction	1
A. Why compare laws?	1
1. How to slide into comparative-law thinking	1
2. The purposes of comparative law	2
B. What belongs to comparative law?	5
1. Status quo: no fixed canon	5
2. The ‘law’ discussed in this book	6
3. The three dimensions of ‘comparative law in context’	7
4. Conclusion: the structure of this book	9
Part I Traditional Comparative Law	11
2 The comparative legal method	13
A. The typical structure of a comparative paper	13
1. Preliminary considerations	13
2. The description of laws	16
3. The comparative analysis	20
4. Critical policy evaluation	22
5. An example from comparative tort law	24
B. Functionalism and universalism in particular	25
1. Functionalism: origins, use and consequences	25
2. Comparative law’s interest in finding commonalities	28
3. The example of the Common Core project	31
C. Critical analysis	33
1. The simplistic approach	33

2. The focus on Western countries	35
3. The critics of functionalism	37
4. The policy evaluation	39
D. Conclusion	40
3 Common law and civil law	41
A. Terminology and origins	41
B. Juxtaposing civil and common law	43
1. Legal methods and sources of law	44
2. Courts and civil procedure	48
3. Comparative contract law	58
C. Critical analysis	64
1. Diversity in continental Europe	64
2. Differences between England and the US	65
3. Western law instead of civil v. common law?	68
D. Conclusion	70
4 Mapping the world's legal systems	72
A. Background and purpose	72
B. Classifying countries	74
1. Bases for classification	74
2. Review of main classifications	75
3. Main commonalities	79
C. Critical analysis	80
1. Overemphasis of differences	80
2. Overemphasis of similarities	82
3. Disregard of hybrids	85
D. Conclusion	93
Part II Extending the Methods of Comparative Law	95
5 Postmodern comparative law	97
A. From George W. Bush to postmodernism	97
B. Deep-level comparative law	98
1. Law as reflecting jurisprudential concepts	98
2. Law as embedded in culture	101
3. Law as requiring immersion	105
4. Law as legal pluralism	107
C. Critical comparative law	108

1. Law as discourse	109
2. Law as politics	114
D. Conclusion	116
6 Socio-legal comparative law	119
A. Setting the scene	119
1. Legal culture and comparative law	119
2. The causality problem in socio-legal research	121
B. Civil litigation, courts and lawyers	127
1. Civil litigation and other forms of dispute resolution	127
2. Litigation rates in the US, England, Germany, the Netherlands and Japan	128
3. Further research on judges, lawyers and the public	132
C. Substantive law ‘in action’ and society	136
1. Comparative commercial law	136
2. Comparative criminal law	140
D. Conclusion	144
7 Numerical comparative law	146
A. Measuring the impact of foreign legal ideas	147
1. Cross-citations between courts	147
2. Measuring foreign influence related to academic research	154
3. Measuring the influence on foreign statute law	156
B. Measuring similarities and differences	159
1. Formal features of the legal system	160
2. Substance of legal rules	164
C. Measuring the quality of legal rules and institutions	167
1. Measuring legal rules	168
2. Measuring courts and other legal and political institutions	172
3. Surveying perceptions about law and its enforcement	176
4. Combined approaches	179
D. Conclusion	186
Part III Global Comparative Law	189
8 Legal transplants	191
A. Conceptual research on legal transplants	191
1. The rationales for legal transplants	191
2. The way legal transplants ‘work’	195
3. Further variants of legal transplants	200

B. Legal transplants throughout history	201
1. Legal transplants in continental Europe	202
2. Colonialism and post-colonialism	205
3. Transplants in non-colonial countries: all that different?	211
4. The globalisation of human rights law	214
C. Conclusion	220
9 Fading state borders	222
A. Setting the scene	222
1. The ‘end of history’ and the ‘end of state’?	222
2. The role of public and private international law	224
3. Forces for convergence, regionalisation and transnationalisation	230
B. Convergence of laws	233
1. Terminology and typology	233
2. The examples of constitutional and company law	234
3. Discussion: normative and positive	238
C. Regionalisation	242
1. Terminology and typology	242
2. The European Union as an example of regional integration	244
3. Discussion: towards multi-level governance	247
D. Transnationalisation	249
1. Terminology and typology	249
2. Examples from transnational commercial law	251
3. Discussion: is private law-making legitimate?	255
E. Conclusion	258
10 Comparative law and development	260
A. The evolving ideas of ‘law and development’	260
B. Development and the rule of law	265
1. Terminology, typology and purpose	265
2. The rule of law in China, Russia and Afghanistan	269
C. The critics of ‘law and development’	275
1. Law does not ‘work’	276
2. Against ‘top-down’ approaches	277
3. Western law out-of-context	279
4. The ‘wrong’ legal rules and institutions	281
D. Conclusion	282

Part IV	Comparative Law as an Open Subject	285
11	Implicit comparative law	287
	A. Introduction to comparative research in social sciences	287
	1. Main rationales for a comparative approach	287
	2. Main types of comparative research	288
	3. Methods, continued: history, logic and concepts	289
	4. Choice of units of comparison	291
	B. Comparative studies of states and their components	292
	1. Determining 'the best' form of government	293
	2. Comparing 'the state in action'	295
	3. Classifying and evaluating policy choices	297
	C. Comparative studies of societies and cultures	301
	1. Understanding differences and similarities between legal systems	302
	2. Showing legal universalities and singularities	305
	3. Measuring legal mentalities and their relevance	309
	D. Conclusion	312
12	Outlook	313
	A. Further directions of 'implicit comparative law'	313
	B. Revisiting 'explicit' research in comparative law	314
	C. Conclusion	316
	References	318
	Index	401