

# Pharmaceutical Patent Protection and World Trade Law

The unresolved problem of access  
to medicines

Jae Sundaram

First published 2018  
 by Routledge  
 2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN  
 and by Routledge  
 711 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017

*Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business*

© 2018 Jae Sundaram

The right of Jae Sundaram to be identified as author of this work has been asserted by him in accordance with sections 77 and 78 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

*Trademark notice:* Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

1138491

*British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data*

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

Names: Sundaram, Jae, author.

Title: Pharmaceutical patent protection and world trade law: the unresolved problem of access to medicines/Jae Sundaram.

Description: New York: Routledge, 2018. | Series: Routledge research in intellectual property | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2018000566 (print) | LCCN 2018000722 (ebook) | ISBN 9781315267692 (Master) | ISBN 9781351973830 (Web PDF) | ISBN 9781351973823 (ePUB 3) | ISBN 9781351973816 (Mobipocket/Kindle) | ISBN 9781138288768 (hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: Drugs—Patents. | Drug accessibility. | Patent laws and legislation. | Foreign trade regulation. | Pharmaceutical industry—Moral and ethical aspects.

Classification: LCC K1519.D78 (ebook) | LCC K1519.D78 S86 2018 (print) | DDC 346.04/86—dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2018000566>

ISBN: 978-1-138-28876-8 (hbk)

ISBN: 978-1-315-26769-2 (ebk)

Typeset in Goudy

by Apex CoVantage, LLC

# Contents

<i>List of cases</i>	xi
<i>List of acronyms</i>	xii
<i>Preface</i>	xv
<b>1 Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
1 <i>Globalising intellectual property rights</i>	1
1.1 <i>Knowledge: the new capital</i>	4
2 <i>Access to medicines and the TRIPS Agreement</i>	6
2.1 <i>Twenty years of TRIPS and the proliferation of RTAs</i>	8
2.2 <i>Organisation of the book and areas of enquiry</i>	10
<b>PART I</b>	
<b>Evolution of intellectual property laws, and the introduction of IP protection in the multilateral trading system</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>2 A jurisprudential enquiry into the justification of international IP rights protection, with particular reference to pharmaceutical patents</b>	<b>17</b>
1 <i>Introduction</i>	17
2 <i>Patent rights: origins, traditional views and economic foundations</i>	18
2.1 <i>Intellectual property rights and the control of 'knowledge'</i>	24
2.2 <i>Patents: an economic analysis</i>	27
2.3 <i>Expansion of intellectual property laws: the haunting colonial legacy</i>	32
3 <i>IP rights policy vis-à-vis human rights: an analysis</i>	36
3.1 <i>Access to medicines as human right</i>	43
3.2 <i>Pharmaceutical corporations and the right to life-saving medicines</i>	47
4 <i>Public right to health v. private right to restrict</i>	49
5 <i>Conclusion</i>	50

<b>3 Intellectual property in the multilateral trading system: forum shifting, TRIPS Agreement, Doha Declaration and TRIPS flexibilities</b>	<b>58</b>
1 Introduction	58
1.1 <i>The quest for stronger IP rights protection and forum shifting</i>	59
1.2 <i>TNPCs and the inclusion of IP rights protection in the WTO</i>	62
2 TRIPS Agreement flexibilities and the Doha Declaration	65
2.1 <i>TRIPS implementation: the difficulties</i>	67
<b>4 Undermining TRIPS flexibilities: FTAs, RTAs, EPAs, TRIPS-plus and stoppage in transit</b>	<b>72</b>
1 Introduction	72
2 TRIPS-plus provisions, FTAs and the WTO	73
2.1 <i>Nature of IP provisions in FTAs</i>	74
3 FTAs: data exclusivity, compulsory licencing	75
3.1 <i>FTAs: parallel imports, patent linkage</i>	78
4 Conclusion	79
<b>PART II</b>	
<b>TRIPS and developing countries: implementation, knowledge economy and IP policymaking</b>	<b>83</b>
<b>5 Brazil: ambitious missions and early TRIPS implementation</b>	<b>85</b>
1 Brazil: right to health as a constitutional right	85
1.1 <i>Brazilian national health system: Sistema Único de Saúde (SUS)</i>	87
2 Response to HIV/AIDS epidemic: right to health and pharmaceutical patents	88
3 Brazilian patent laws: from the nineteenth century alvará to TRIPS implementation	90
3.1 Key provisions 1: parallel imports, Bolar exception and compulsory licencing	92
3.1.1 <i>Use of price negotiation and compulsory licencing provision</i>	95
3.1.2 <i>Setback: seizure of generic medicines-in-transit</i>	97
3.2 Key provisions 2: prior consent, ANVISA and second use medical patent	99
3.3 <i>Mailbox legacy, backlog and the patent prosecution highway</i>	104
3.4 <i>Access to health and medicines and judicial enforcement: trouble in paradise</i>	104
3.5 <i>Brazil's balancing act: the current state of play and proposed changes</i>	107
4 Conclusion	109

<b>6 China: the uneasy transition</b>	119
1 Introduction: in a league of its own	119
2 Intellectual property laws: origins and evolution	120
2.1 Market economy reforms and IP laws	122
3 TRIPS compliance: new laws, national IP strategy and pharmaceutical patent rights	124
3.1 Public health: TRIPS, compulsory licencing	127
3.2 Public health: access to medicines and the right to health	129
4 Conclusion	130
<b>7 India: the transition from process to product patent</b>	134
1 Introduction	134
2 Indian patent laws: pre-independence	135
2.1 Post-independence	137
2.2 Justice Ayyangar Committee Report	138
2.3 Indian Patent Act 1970	139
3 WTO membership and TRIPS negotiation	140
3.1 TRIPS compliance	142
4 The Amendment Act 2005	143
4.1 Compulsory licencing	144
4.1.1 The first compulsory licence case: Natco v. Bayer	147
4.1.2 BDR v. Bristol-Myers Squibb	148
4.1.3 Lee Pharma v. AstraZeneca	149
4.1.4 A closer look at the compulsory licence provision	150
5 The aftermath	151
5.1 Pre-grant and post-grant opposition	152
5.2 Patentability and patent evergreening	153
6 Interpreting section 3(d): the Novartis saga	155
6.1 Case analysis	157
7 Exhaustion of patent rights and parallel imports	159
7.1 Indian pharmaceutical policy	160
8 Conclusion	163
<b>8 South Africa: against all odds</b>	169
1 Sub-Saharan Africa: the Uruguay Round and IP rights	169
2 South Africa: an introduction	172
2.1 Democratic South Africa: hopes and setbacks	173
3 The Medicines Act: the court and street battles	175
4 TRIPS flexibilities, the Doha Declaration and sub-Saharan Africa	179
4.1 Post-apartheid South Africa and the healthcare system	181
4.2 Healthcare, human rights and the constitutional court	185

## x Contents

5	<i>Judicial interpretation of constitutional rights</i>	186
5.1	<i>The implications of the court decisions</i>	188
5.2	<i>The national health insurance and the National Health Act 2013</i>	190
6	<i>Conclusion</i>	191
9	<b>Kenya: can generics still reach the needy?</b>	197
1	<i>Kenya: an introduction</i>	197
2	<i>HIV/AIDS and other health care woes</i>	199
3	<i>IP legislative framework: pre- and post-TRIPS era</i>	200
3.1	<i>The Industrial Property Act 1989</i>	200
3.2	<i>The Industrial Property Act 2001</i>	201
4	<i>Kenya: the pharmaceutical hub of EAC</i>	205
5	<i>The right to life: Anti-Counterfeit Act 2008, the new constitution and Patricia Asero Ochieng &amp; 2 Others v. Attorney General &amp; Another [2012]</i>	208
5.1	<i>The Anti-Counterfeit Act 2008</i>	208
5.2	<i>Patricia Asero Ochieng &amp; 2 Others v. Attorney General &amp; Another, and the 'right to health' under the new constitution</i>	210
5.3	<i>The judgment and findings</i>	212
6	<i>What was achieved?</i>	214
7	<i>Conclusion: way forward</i>	215
	<b>PART III</b>	
	<b>TRIPS at what cost?</b>	221
10	<b>TRIPS Agreement and the future of access to affordable medicines</b>	223
1	<i>Introduction</i>	223
1.1	<i>The costs and benefits of TRIPS to developing countries</i>	224
2	<i>The promise of TRIPS: will it ever be realised?</i>	227
3	<i>The role of non-state actors</i>	229
4	<i>Conclusion: the forgotten right to health</i>	230
	<i>Index</i>	235