

An Introduction to Transnational Criminal Law

Second Edition

NEIL BOISTER
University of Canterbury

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

1124804

Great Clarendon Street, Oxford, OX2 6DP,
United Kingdom

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford.
It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship,
and education by publishing worldwide. Oxford is a registered trade mark of
Oxford University Press in the UK and in certain other countries

© N. Boister 2018

The moral rights of the author have been asserted

First Edition published in 2012

Second Edition published in 2018

Impression: 1

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in
a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the
prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted
by law, by licence or under terms agreed with the appropriate reprographics
rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the
above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the
address above

You must not circulate this work in any other form
and you must impose this same condition on any acquirer

Crown copyright material is reproduced under Class Licence
Number C01P0000148 with the permission of OPSI
and the Queen's Printer for Scotland

Published in the United States of America by Oxford University Press
198 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016, United States of America

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
Data available

Library of Congress Control Number: 2017958195

ISBN 978-0-19-879599-5 (hbk.)

ISBN 978-0-19-879608-4 (pbk.)

Printed and bound by
CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY

Links to third party websites are provided by Oxford in good faith and
for information only. Oxford disclaims any responsibility for the materials
contained in any third party website referenced in this work.

Contents

<i>Table of International Cases</i>	xix
<i>Table of National Cases</i>	xxiii
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xxxiii
<i>Table of Treaties and Other International Instruments</i>	xli
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	lix

I. INTRODUCTION

1. What is Transnational Crime?	3
1.1 Introduction	3
1.2 The Nature of Transnational Crime	3
1.2.1 The meaning of 'transnational crime'	3
1.2.2 Characteristics and causes of transnational crime	5
1.2.3 Categorizing transnational crimes	9
1.3 Assessing and Responding to Transnational Crime	11
1.3.1 Global cooperation: an unavoidable response to a global threat?	11
1.3.2 The scale of transnational crime	12
1.3.3 Threat identification, the formation of a transnational interest, and pathways to the development of a policy response	13
1.3.4 The nature of the policy-making process	16
2. What is Transnational Criminal Law?	17
2.1 Introduction	17
2.2 Transnational Criminal Law as a Legal System	18
2.2.1 Transnational criminal law distinguished from transnational criminal procedure	18
2.2.2 The inter-state dimension	19
2.2.3 Transnational crimes and penalties	23
2.2.4 Provisions for procedural cooperation	27
2.2.5 Subjects and objects of transnational criminal law	29
2.2.6 Distinguishing transnational criminal law from international criminal law <i>stricto sensu</i>	30
2.2.7 Transnational criminal law as a system of laws	32
2.3 The System's Goals and Values	33
2.3.1 Effective suppression	33
2.3.2 Supply interdiction	34
2.3.3 Security	34
2.3.4 Preservation of sovereignty	35
2.3.5 Legitimacy	36
2.3.6 Legality	39
2.3.7 Human rights	40
2.4 Conclusion	41

II. CRIMES

3. Piracy and Maritime Safety Offences	45
3.1 Introduction	45
3.2 The Nature of Piracy	45
3.3 Piracy: International or Transnational Crime?	46
3.4 The Definition of the Crime of Piracy	47
3.5 The Elements of the Crime of Piracy	48
3.5.1 Violence, detention, or depredation	48
3.5.2 The limitation to acts for private ends	49
3.5.3 The 'two ship' requirement	50
3.5.4 The limitation to the high seas	51
3.5.5 The key weakness of the UNCLOS definition	51
3.6 The Maritime Safety Offences	52
3.7 Punishment of Piracy and SUA Offences	54
3.8 Problems and Progress off Somalia	54
3.9 Conclusion	55
4. Slavery and Human Trafficking	56
4.1 Introduction	56
4.2 Slavery	57
4.2.1 Enslavement and slave trading	57
4.2.2 Suppression of slavery under international law	57
4.3 Forced Labour and Debt Bondage	60
4.4 'White' Slavery and Trafficking for Prostitution	61
4.5 Human Trafficking	62
4.5.1 The nature of human trafficking	62
4.5.2 Criminalization of human trafficking under the Human Trafficking Protocol	62
4.6 Modern Slavery	68
4.7 Protection of Victims	69
4.7.1 General	69
4.7.2 Non-penalization of victims	71
4.7.3 Right to remain	73
4.8 Pressure to Implement	74
4.9 Conclusion	75
5. Migrant Smuggling	76
5.1 From Refugees to Smuggled Migrants	76
5.2 The Nature of Migrant Smuggling	77
5.3 Background to the Migrant Smuggling Protocol	78
5.4 Crimes	78
5.4.1 Smuggling migrants	78
5.4.2 Document fraud	82
5.4.3 Enabling a person to remain clandestinely or otherwise illegally	82
5.4.4 Attempts, secondary parties, organizing and directing, corporate liability	83
5.4.5 Limitation of international cooperation to transnational migrant smuggling by an organized criminal group	83
5.4.6 Punishment	83

5.5	The Protection of Migrants' Human Rights	84
5.5.1	General	84
5.5.2	Migrants' immunity from prosecution for Protocol offences	85
5.5.3	Reinforcing existing protections	86
5.5.4	Criticisms of the human rights protections in the Protocol	87
5.6	Conclusion	87
6.	Drug Trafficking	89
6.1	Introduction	89
6.2	Drugs and Harm	89
6.2.1	Illicit use and harm	89
6.2.2	Illicit supply and harm	90
6.2.3	Drug prohibition and harm	90
6.3	The Institutionalization of Drug Prohibition through International Law	91
6.3.1	Origins	91
6.3.2	Commercial regulation of medicinal drugs	91
6.3.3	Penal measures	92
6.3.4	The relationship between licit and illicit supply	92
6.3.5	Drug classification	93
6.4	Supply Reduction in the Drug Conventions	93
6.4.1	Suppressing the chain of supply	93
6.4.2	Production and refinement	94
6.4.3	Transportation	94
6.4.4	Distribution	95
6.4.5	Possession and purchase for supply	95
6.4.6	Support and organization of supply	96
6.4.7	Punishment for supply offences	97
6.5	Demand Reduction Provisions in the Drug Conventions	99
6.5.1	Under the 1961 Convention	99
6.5.2	Under the 1988 Convention	100
6.6	Treatment and Harm Reduction	101
6.7	The Enforcement of the International Drug Control System	102
6.8	Conclusion: Towards Reform?	103
7.	Terrorism	105
7.1	Introduction	105
7.2	Defining Terrorism	106
7.3	Aviation Offences	107
7.4	Crimes against Internationally Protected Persons	110
7.5	Nuclear Terrorism	110
7.6	Hostage-taking	111
7.7	Maritime Safety	111
7.8	Terrorist Bombings	112
7.9	Terrorist Financing	113
7.10	A Comprehensive Counter-terrorism Convention?	115
7.11	Regional Counter-terrorism Conventions	115
7.12	Suppressing Terrorism through the UN Security Council	116
7.13	Foreign Terrorist Fighters	118
7.14	The Expanding Scope of Domestic Anticipatory Offences	120

7.15	Anti-terrorism and Human Rights	122
7.16	Terrorism as a Core International Crime?	123
7.17	Conclusion	125
8.	Transnational Organized Crime	126
8.1	Introduction	126
8.2	The Nature of Transnational Organized Crime	126
8.3	Early Legislative Steps against Organized Crime	129
8.4	Responding to Transnational Organized Crime: The Development of the UN Convention against Transnational Organized Crime (UNTOC)	130
8.5	The Failure to Define Organized Crime in the UNTOC	132
8.6	Conditions for the Application of the UNTOC to UNTOC and Protocol Crimes: Transnationality and Involvement of an Organized Criminal Group	135
8.7	Conditions for the Residual Application of the UNTOC to other 'Serious Crimes'	136
8.8	The UNTOC's Double-pronged Strategy against Organized Crime	137
8.9	Criminalization of Participation in an Organized Criminal Group	137
8.9.1	Introduction	137
8.9.2	The conspiracy model	138
8.9.3	The participation model	139
8.9.4	Secondary participation	140
8.9.5	State practice	140
8.10	Money Laundering	141
8.11	Corruption	142
8.12	Obstruction of Justice	142
8.13	Penalties for UNTOC Offences	143
8.14	Criminal Responsibility of Legal Persons	143
8.15	Conclusion	143
9.	Corruption	146
9.1	Introduction	146
9.2	The Nature of Corruption	146
9.3	Forerunner Legislation	148
9.4	The Inter-American Convention against Corruption	150
9.5	The OECD Anti-bribery Convention	151
9.6	Other Regional Anti-corruption Instruments	153
9.7	The UN Convention against Corruption	155
9.7.1	The development of the Convention	155
9.7.2	Crimes	155
9.7.3	Penalties	162
9.8	The Effectiveness of the Anti-corruption Conventions	162
9.9	The Increasing Resort to Soft Law	166
9.10	Conclusion	167
10.	Money Laundering	168
10.1	Introduction	168
10.2	The Nature of Money Laundering	168

10.3	The Rationale for Criminalizing Money Laundering as a Separate Offence	170
10.4	The Domestic Roots of the Money Laundering Offence	171
10.5	The 'External' Elements of the Money Laundering Offence— The Predicate Offence	173
10.5.1	From laundering drug trafficking proceeds to 'all crimes' laundering	173
10.5.2	Extraterritorial predicates	175
10.5.3	Self-laundering	176
10.5.4	Terrorist offences as predicate offences	176
10.6	The 'Internal' Elements of the Money Laundering Offence	177
10.6.1	Introduction	177
10.6.2	Placement	178
10.6.3	Layering	178
10.6.4	Integration	179
10.6.5	The mental element	179
10.6.6	Inchoate laundering and participation	180
10.7	Criminal Liability for Legal Persons	180
10.8	Punishment for Money Laundering	181
10.9	The Role of the Financial Action Task Force	182
10.10	Implementation of Money Laundering Offences	184
10.11	Conclusion	185
11.	Cybercrimes	187
11.1	Introduction	187
11.2	The Nature of Cybercrime	188
11.3	Towards a Global Response that Respects Human Rights	189
11.4	The Council of Europe Cybercrime Convention	189
11.4.1	Introduction	189
11.4.2	Confidentiality, integrity, and availability offences	190
11.4.3	Computer-related offences	192
11.4.4	Content-related offences	193
11.4.5	Ancillary crimes and related provisions	194
11.4.6	Penalties	195
11.4.7	The Cybercrime Convention's substantive shortcomings	195
11.5	Other Regional Developments	196
11.6	A UN Cybercrime Convention?	198
11.7	Conclusion	199
12.	Environmental Crimes	200
12.1	Introduction	200
12.2	Illegal, Unregulated, and Unreported Fishing	202
12.3	Illegal Trading in Endangered Species	205
12.4	Illegal Logging	207
12.5	Pollution	208
12.6	Illegal Transboundary Movement of Waste	208
12.7	Future Development of Environmental Crimes	210
13.	Firearms Trafficking	212
13.1	Introduction	212
13.2	Background to the Firearms Protocol	213

13.3	Scope and Purpose of the Firearms Protocol	214
13.4	Crimes and Punishments	215
13.5	Preventing Diversion from the Licit Trade	216
13.6	The UN Programme of Action	217
13.7	The Tracing Instrument	218
13.8	Controlling the Licit Trade: The Arms Trade Treaty	219
13.9	Conclusion	220
14.	Illicit Trafficking in Cultural Artefacts	221
14.1	Introduction	221
14.2	The Nature of Illicit Trafficking in Cultural Property	221
14.3	Measures against Trafficking of Cultural Property in Wartime: The 1954 Hague Convention and its Protocols	223
14.4	Regulating Supply to the Market: The UNESCO Conventions	224
14.5	Criminal Suppression: The Failed 1985 European Convention and the 2017 Nicosia Convention	225
14.6	Recovery and Restitution under Private Law: The UNIDROIT Convention	227
14.7	Attempting to Plug the Gaps in the Effective Suppression of Illicit Trafficking in Cultural Property	227
14.8	Conclusion	229
15.	Emerging Transnational Crimes	231
15.1	Introduction	231
15.2	Anti-competitive Conduct	232
15.3	Intellectual Property Offences	233
15.4	Counterfeiting of Medicines	236
15.5	Identity Fraud	238
15.6	Offences against Children	238
15.7	The Necessity of Further Suppression Conventions	239
III. ENFORCEMENT		
16.	Jurisdiction over Transnational Crime	245
16.1	Introduction	245
16.2	Establishing and Enforcing Jurisdiction	246
16.3	Limitations on Jurisdiction over Transnational Crime	247
16.3.1	The permissive approach versus sovereignty	247
16.3.2	Limitations on the expansion of jurisdiction	248
16.3.3	Legality as a limitation on jurisdiction over transnational crime	249
16.4	Extensions of Jurisdiction Recognized by the Suppression Conventions	250
16.5	Territoriality	251
16.5.1	Strict territoriality	251
16.5.2	Quasi-territoriality	252
16.5.3	Qualified territoriality	253
16.6	Personality	257
16.6.1	Nationality/active personality	257
16.6.2	Passive personality	260
16.6.3	Protective	262

16.7	<i>Aut Dedere Aut Judicare</i>	264
16.8	Absolute Universality	268
16.9	Concurrent Jurisdiction	270
16.10	Immunity from Jurisdiction over Transnational Crime	273
16.10.1	Introduction	273
16.10.2	Sovereign immunity	273
16.10.3	Diplomatic immunity	275
16.10.4	Immunity of officials from inter-governmental organizations	276
16.10.5	Immunity of officials under their own national law	276
16.10.6	Removal of immunity for criminal acts	277
16.11	Conclusion	278
17.	International Law Enforcement Cooperation	280
17.1	Enforcing an Established Jurisdiction	280
17.2	Territorial Enforcement against Transnational Crime	280
17.3	The Necessity for and Legal Nature of International Cooperation against Extraterritorial Crime	281
17.4	The Development of Direct Police to Police Contact	283
17.5	Information Storage and Exchange	284
17.5.1	Introduction	284
17.5.2	Treaty provisions for information exchange	285
17.5.3	Information exchange in practice	287
17.6	Operational Cooperation	290
17.6.1	Introduction	290
17.6.2	Liaison	290
17.6.3	Joint investigations	291
17.6.4	Hot pursuit	293
17.6.5	Controlled delivery	293
17.6.6	Undercover operations	294
17.6.7	Electronic surveillance	296
17.7	Policing the High Seas	298
17.7.1	Enforcing flag state jurisdiction	298
17.7.2	Enforcing jurisdiction over stateless vessels	298
17.7.3	Enforcing jurisdiction over foreign vessels	298
17.8	Policing the Financial System	301
17.8.1	Introduction	301
17.8.2	Globalizing risk assessment	302
17.8.3	Removing bank secrecy	303
17.8.4	Financial Intelligence Units	304
17.8.5	Counter-terrorist financing	305
17.9	Law Enforcement Training	306
17.10	Human Rights in Law Enforcement Cooperation	306
17.11	International Law Enforcement Organizations	308
17.12	The Emerging Transnational Law Enforcement Culture	310
18.	Legal Assistance	311
18.1	Introduction	311
18.2	The Nature of Legal Assistance	311
18.3	Letters Rogatory	312
18.4	Mutual Legal Assistance	313
18.4.1	The development of mutual legal assistance treaties (MLATs)	313

18.4.2	The inclusion of mutual legal assistance provisions in the suppression conventions	314
18.4.3	The general duty in suppression conventions to provide mutual legal assistance	315
18.4.4	The limitation of mutual legal assistance to criminal proceedings	315
18.4.5	Types of mutual legal assistance available	316
18.4.6	The conditions for and exceptions to mutual legal assistance	319
18.4.7	The procedure for applying for mutual legal assistance	323
18.4.8	Concurrent requests for legal assistance	327
18.5	The Rights of Individuals to Legal Assistance and in the Mutual Legal Assistance Process	327
18.6	Alternative Methods of Acquiring Evidence Abroad: Getting Around the 'MLAT Problem'	328
18.6.1	Introduction	328
18.6.2	'Long-arm' subpoenas	329
18.6.3	'Long-arm' search warrants	329
18.6.4	Unsanctioned extraterritorial evidence gathering	330
18.7	Conclusion	331
19.	Asset Recovery	333
19.1	Introduction	333
19.2	The International Development of Asset Recovery	334
19.3	Interim Measures: Identification, Tracing, Freezing, and Seizing	335
19.4	Conviction-based Confiscation	337
19.4.1	General	337
19.4.2	Reversing the onus of proof	337
19.4.3	Value confiscation	338
19.4.4	Third party confiscation	339
19.5	Non-conviction-based Forfeiture	340
19.5.1	Pursuing 'guilty' property	340
19.5.2	Using civil process	341
19.5.3	Forfeiture versus property rights	342
19.5.4	International reluctance	344
19.6	Transnational Asset Recovery	344
19.6.1	Domestic platform	344
19.6.2	Making contact and seeking assistance	345
19.6.3	International platforms for asset recovery	345
19.6.4	Interim legal measures in the requested state	346
19.6.5	Final legal measures in the requested state	346
19.6.6	General conditions and grounds for refusal of assistance	347
19.6.7	International cooperation in non-conviction-based forfeiture	348
19.6.8	Practical difficulties in transnational asset recovery	348
19.6.9	Protecting human rights in transnational asset recovery	349
19.7	Dispersal of Recovered Assets	350
19.8	Legitimacy and Effectiveness	352
20.	Extradition of Transnational Criminals	353
20.1	Introduction	353
20.2	The Legal Basis for Extradition	356
20.2.1	Extradition treaties, schemes, and national laws	356
20.2.2	Extradition in the suppression conventions	357

20.3	The Conditions for and Exceptions to Extradition	359
20.3.1	Conditions, exceptions, and non-inquiry	359
20.3.2	Double/dual criminality	359
20.3.3	Extraditability	364
20.3.4	Sufficiency of evidence	365
20.3.5	Specialty	367
20.3.6	Political offence exception	368
20.3.7	Non-discrimination	370
20.3.8	Nationality exception	370
20.3.9	Forum bar	373
20.3.10	<i>Nemo bis in idem</i>	374
20.3.11	The military and fiscal offence exceptions	375
20.3.12	Procedural and practical obstacles	375
20.3.13	Penalty exceptions	376
20.4	Human Rights in Extradition	376
20.4.1	The development of human rights bars	376
20.4.2	Rights and prohibitions relevant to extradition	378
20.4.3	Assurances	381
20.5	Extradition Procedure	382
20.6	Simplified Extradition	384
20.7	Surrender under the European Arrest Warrant	384
20.8	Alternatives to Extradition	387
20.9	Conclusion	389

IV. INSTITUTIONS, IMPLEMENTATION, AND DEVELOPMENT

21.	Institutions	393
21.1	Introduction	393
21.2	The UN's Drug Control and Criminal Justice Mandates	393
21.3	Policy-making at the UN	394
21.4	Law-making at the UN	396
21.5	Oversight: The International Narcotics Control Board and Conferences of Parties	396
21.6	Administration: the UN Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC)	397
21.7	Networking: The Programme Network of Institutes (PNI)	398
21.8	Other Intergovernmental Institutions and Organizations	399
21.9	Civil Society	400
21.10	Conclusion	400
22.	Implementation and Compliance	402
22.1	Introduction	402
22.2	Implementation	404
22.3	Compliance	405
22.4	Multilateral Review Mechanisms	408
22.5	Coordinated Unilateral Action: The FATF Evaluation and Sanctions Process	410
22.6	The Carrots: Technical Assistance	411

22.7	The Sticks: Mechanisms for Enforcing Implementation and Compliance	413
22.8	A Transnational Criminal Court?	416
22.9	Conclusion	418
23.	The Future Development of Transnational Criminal Law	420
23.1	Development Thus Far	420
23.2	Moving away from a System of Crime Control	422
23.3	Using General Principles to Guide Development	422
23.4	Principles for Criminalization	422
23.5	Principles of Substantive Criminal Liability	423
23.6	Principles of Punishment	424
23.7	Principles for Establishing Criminal Jurisdiction	425
23.8	Principles for Enforcing Criminal Jurisdiction	426
23.9	Restructuring the Transnational Legal Space	427
	<i>Index</i>	429