

Constitutional Change and Transformation in Latin America

Edited by
Richard Albert
Carlos Bernal
and
Juliano Zaiden Benvindo

• HART •

OXFORD • LONDON • NEW YORK • NEW DELHI • SYDNEY

HART PUBLISHING

Bloomsbury Publishing Plc

1151034

Kemp House, Chawley Park, Cumnor Hill, Oxford, OX2 9PH, UK

HART PUBLISHING, the Hart/Stag logo, BLOOMSBURY and the Diana logo are trademarks of Bloomsbury Publishing Plc

First published in Great Britain 2019

Copyright © The editors and contributors severally 2019

The editors and contributors have asserted their right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 to be identified as Authors of this work.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers.

While every care has been taken to ensure the accuracy of this work, no responsibility for loss or damage occasioned to any person acting or refraining from action as a result of any statement in it can be accepted by the authors, editors or publishers.

All UK Government legislation and other public sector information used in the work is Crown Copyright ©. All House of Lords and House of Commons information used in the work is Parliamentary Copyright ©. This information is reused under the terms of the Open Government Licence v3.0 (<http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/version/3>) except where otherwise stated.

All Eur-lex material used in the work is © European Union, <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/>, 1998–2019.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Names: Albert, Richard (Law professor), editor. | Bernal Pulido, Carlos, editor. | Benavido, Juliano Zaiden, editor.

Title: Constitutional change and transformation in Latin America / edited by Richard Albert, Carlos Bernal and Juliano Zaiden Benavido.

Description: Oxford, UK ; Chicago, Illinois : Hart Publishing, 2019. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019007696 (print) | LCCN 2019009137 (ebook) | ISBN 9781509923519 (EPub) | ISBN 9781509923502 (hardback : alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Constitutional law—Latin America.

Classification: LCC KG548 (ebook) | LCC KG548 .C664 2019 (print) | DDC 342.803—dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2019007696>

ISBN: HB: 978-1-50992-350-2
ePDF: 978-1-50992-352-6
ePub: 978-1-50992-351-9

Typeset by Compuscript Ltd, Shannon

Printed and bound in Great Britain by CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon CR0 4YY



To find out more about our authors and books visit www.hartpublishing.co.uk. Here you will find extracts, author information, details of forthcoming events and the option to sign up for our newsletters.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

*Foreword: The Life and Death of Constitutions in Latin America:
Constitutional Amendments, the Role of Courts and Democracy*..... v

Luís Roberto Barroso

List of Contributors xiii

Introduction: Facts and Fictions in Latin American Constitutionalism..... 1

Juliano Zaiden Benvindo, Carlos Bernal and Richard Albert

PART I

POPULAR AND POPULIST CONSTITUTIONAL DEMOCRACY

1. *Constitution-Making (without Constituent) Power: On the Conceptual
Limits of the Power to Replace or Revise the Constitution*..... 21
Carlos Bernal
2. *Continuity and Change in Latin America: The Ever-Present
Authoritarianism and the Democratic Capacities of the New Latin
American Constitutions*..... 51
Fernando José Gonçalves Acunha
3. *Constitutional Moments and Constitutional Thresholds in Brazil:
Mass Protests and the 'Performative Meaning' of Constitutionalism*..... 71
Juliano Zaiden Benvindo
4. *Constitutional Unamendability in Latin America Gone Wrong?*..... 93
Yaniv Roznai

PART II

JUDICIAL REVIEW OF CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT

5. *The Colombian Constitutional Court's Doctrine on the Substitution
of the Constitution* 119
Juan F González-Bertomeu
6. *We the People, They the Media: Judicial Review of Constitutional
Amendments and Public Opinion in Colombia* 143
Vicente F Benítez-R

xii *Table of Contents*

7. *'Resistance by Interpretation': Supreme Court Justices as Counter-Reformers to Constitutional Changes in Brazil in the 90s* 167
Diego Werneck Arguelhes and Mariana Mota Prado
8. *The Judicial Review of Constitutional Amendments in Brazil and the Super-Counter-majoritarian Role of the Brazilian Supreme Court – The Case of the 'ADI 5017'* 189
Eneida Desiree Salgado and Carolina Alves das Chagas
9. *The Role of the Chilean Constitutional Court in Times of Change* 203
Sergio Verdugo

PART III

CONSTITUTIONAL REFORM AND STABILITY

10. *The Paradox of Mexico's Constitutional Hyper-Reformism: Enabling Peaceful Transition While Blocking Democratic Consolidation* 221
Francisca Pou Giménez and Andrea Pozas-Loyo
11. *The Political Sources of Constitutional Amendment (Non)Difficulty in Mexico* 243
Mariana Velasco Rivera
12. *Subnational Constitutionalism and Constitutional Change in Brazil: The Impact of Federalism in Constitutional Stability* 269
Breno Baía Magalhães
13. *Legislative Process and Constitutional Change in Brazil: On the Pathologies of the Procedure for Amending the 1988 Constitution* 291
Leonardo Augusto de Andrade Barbosa
14. *Transformative Constitutionalism and Extreme Inequality: A Problematic Relationship* 311
Magdalena Correa Henao
- Index* 339