

Law, Rights and Discourse

The Legal Philosophy of Robert Alexy

Edited by
George Pavlakos



• H A R T •
PUBLISHING

OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON
2007

Published in North America (US and Canada) by
Hart Publishing
c/o International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Avenue, Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213-3786
USA
Tel: +1 503 287 3093 or toll-free: (1) 800 944 6190
Fax: +1 503 280 8832
E-mail: orders@isbs.com
Web Site: www.isbs.com

© The editors and contributors severally 2007

The editors and contributors have asserted their rights under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as the author of this work.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission of Hart Publishing, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Hart Publishing at the address below.

Hart Publishing, 16c Worcester Place, Oxford, OX1 2JW
Telephone: +44 (0)1865 517530 Fax: +44 (0)1865 510710
E-mail: mail@hartpub.co.uk
Website: <http://www.hartpub.co.uk>

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

Data Available

ISBN-13: 978-1-84113-676-9 (hardback)

Typeset by Columns Design Ltd, Reading
Printed and bound in Great Britain by
TJ International Ltd, Padstow, Cornwall

Contents

<i>Preface</i>	vii
<i>List of Contributors</i>	xi
Introduction	1
George Pavlakos	
PART I: A DEBATE ON LEGAL POSITIVISM	
1. The Argument from Justice, or How Not to Reply to Legal Positivism	17
Joseph Raz	
2. An Answer to Joseph Raz	37
Robert Alexy	
PART II: LAW AND MORALITY	
3. Why Law Makes No Claims	59
Neil MacCormick	
4. How Non-Positivism can Accommodate Legal Certainty	69
Stefano Bertea	
5. Two Concepts of Objectivity	83
George Pavlakos	
6. Discourse Ethics, Legal Positivism and the Law	109
Philippos Vassiloyannis	
PART III: CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS	
7. Political Liberalism and the Structure of Rights: On the Place and Limits of the Proportionality Requirement	131
Mattias Kumm	
8. Proportionality, Discretion and the Second Law of Balancing	167
Julian Rivers	
9. Human Rights and the Claim to Correctness in the Theory of	
Robert Alexy	189
Jan Sieckmann	

x *Contents*

10. Three-Person Justification	207
Jonathan Gorman	
PART IV: DISCOURSE AND ARGUMENTATION	
11. Law's Claim to Correctness	225
Maeve Cooke	
12. A Teleological Approach to Legal Dialogues	249
Giovanni Sartor	
13. The Claim to Correctness and Inferentialism: Alexy's Theory of Practical Reason Reconsidered	275
Giorgio Bongiovanni, Antonino Rotolo and Corrado Roversi	
14. The Concept of Validity in a Theory of Social Action	301
Carsten Heidemann	
15. The Weight Formula and Argumentation	319
Bartosz Brożek	
PART V: COMMENTS AND RESPONSES	
16. Thirteen Replies	333
Robert Alexy	
<i>Index</i>	367