

Regulating Vertical Agreements
A Comparative Law and Economics
Review of the EU and Brazil

Maria Fernanda Caporale Madi

Published by:

Kluwer Law International B.V.
PO Box 316
2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn
The Netherlands
E-mail: international-sales@wolterskluwer.com
Website: rus.wolterskluwer.com

Sold and distributed by:

Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory U.S.
7201 McKinney Circle
Frederick, MD 21704
United States of America
Email: customer.service@wolterskluwer.com

Printed on acid-free paper.

ISBN 978-94-035-2650-8

e-Book: ISBN 978-94-035-2651-5
web-PDF: ISBN 978-94-035-2652-2

© 2020 Maria Fernanda Caporale Madi

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without written permission from the publisher.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. More information can be found at: rus.wolterskluwer.com/policies/permissions-reprints-and-licensing

Printed and bound by CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY

Table of Contents

Foreword	xi
List of Abbreviations	xiii
List of Figures	xv
List of Tables	xvii
Acknowledgements	xix
CHAPTER 1	
Introduction	1
1.1 Setting the Scene: Motivations and Concerns	1
1.1.1 The Complex Assessment of Vertical Agreements	1
1.1.2 The Recent Changes in the Brazilian Legal Framework	3
1.1.3 The Experience from the EU and Its Upcoming Challenges	5
1.2 The Aim of the Book	7
1.3 Overview of the Chapters	8
CHAPTER 2	
Economic Analysis of Vertical Agreements	11
2.1 Introduction: The Regulatory Dilemma of Vertical Agreements	11
2.2 The Economic Efficiencies of Vertical Agreements	14
2.2.1 Solving the Double Markup Problem	15
2.2.2 Preventing Free-Riding	15
2.2.3 Reducing Transaction Costs	19
2.2.4 Other Efficiency Arguments: Considerations Regarding Online Markets	23
2.3 Anticompetitive Effects of Vertical Restraints	25
2.3.1 Increasing Collusion in Markets	25
2.3.2 Reducing Intra- and/or Inter-brand Competition	27

Table of Contents

2.3.3	Market Foreclosure and Higher Barriers to Entry	28
2.3.4	Other Anticompetitive Effects: Considerations Regarding Online Markets	29
2.4	The Double-Sided Aspect of Selected Vertical Restraints: An Overview of Economic Efficiencies and Anticompetitive Effects	31
2.4.1	Resale Price-Fixing (Resale Price Maintenance or RPM)	31
2.4.2	Geo-Blocking	33
2.4.3	Selective Distribution	34
2.5	The Political Economy of Competition Policies	35
2.6	The Complexity of Vertical Agreements and the Enduring Debate on Policymaking	38
CHAPTER 3		
	Antitrust Enforcement of Vertical Agreements in Brazil	41
3.1	Introduction: The Choice of Brazil as a Case Study	41
3.2	History and Framework of the Brazilian Competition Law and Policy	43
3.2.1	The Origins of Competition Policy in Brazil: From 1934 to 2011	43
3.2.2	The Current Goals of Competition Law in Brazil	46
3.3	The Evolution of Brazilian Competition Law Oriented to Vertical Agreements	49
3.3.1	Vertical Agreements under Law No. 8.884/1994: An Unclear Legal Framework	50
3.3.2	Vertical Agreements under Law No. 12.529/2011: Favouring <i>Ex Post</i> Enforcement	52
3.4	The <i>Ex Post</i> Enforcement in Brazil: Relevant Jurisprudence and Current Challenges	56
3.4.1	RPM: <i>SKF</i> Case	59
3.4.2	Geo-Blocking: <i>Iguatemi</i> Cases	64
3.4.3	Cases Involving Digital Businesses	66
3.4.4	Challenges to <i>Ex Post</i> Enforcement	67
3.4.4.1	CADE's Institutional Design	67
3.4.4.2	The Judiciary System	69
3.5	The Context of Antitrust Policy in Brazil: The Interacting Group of Agents	70
3.5.1	Behind Resolution No. 17/2016: Identifying Interest Groups of Agents	71
3.5.2	Main Assumptions about the Behaviour of Relevant Actors	74
3.5.3	Qualitative Analysis of the Context of Public Consultation No. 02/2016	76
3.6	Concluding Remarks	80
CHAPTER 4		
	Vertical Agreement Policy and Enforcement in the European Union	83
4.1	Introduction: The Choice of the EU in the Comparative Study	83
4.2	History and Framework of EU Competition Law	85

4.3	The Modernization of EU Competition Law	89
4.3.1	The Green Paper and the White Paper	89
4.3.2	The Context of the EU Modernization of Competition Law: A Public Choice Perspective	92
4.4	The 2004 Reform: The Three Enforcement Components	97
4.4.1	The Consolidated Antitrust Jurisprudence, the VBER and the Guidelines	97
4.4.2	The ECN: Cooperation among EU Member States	100
4.4.3	Intensification of <i>Ex Post</i> Control	101
4.5	The Challenges of the Current EU Enforcement of Vertical Agreements	102
4.5.1	Challenge #1: Uncertainties of the Digital Economy	105
4.5.1.1	Selective Distribution in Online Marketplaces	106
4.5.1.2	MFN Clauses and Price Parity Arrangements	108
4.5.2	Challenge #2: Different Procedural and Institutional Realities among the EU Member States	111
4.6	Concluding Remarks	119
CHAPTER 5		
	Enforcement Costs of Vertical Agreements: A Comparative Law and Economics Analysis	121
5.1	Introduction: The Policy Options for Vertical Agreements	121
5.2	Literature Review	123
5.3	Multiple Dimensions of Antitrust Enforcement	125
5.3.1	Timing of Legal Intervention	126
5.3.2	Form of Sanction	126
5.3.3	The Role of Public and Private Agents	127
5.3.4	Considerations on Enforcement Costs	129
5.4	Information Costs	130
5.4.1	Cost of Gathering Market Information	130
5.4.2	Cost of Assessing the Effects of Vertical Agreements	133
5.5	Incentive Costs	138
5.5.1	Fines	138
5.5.2	Antitrust Errors	142
5.5.3	The Role of the Judiciary and Private Enforcement	148
5.5.4	The General Trust in Institutions	151
5.6	Administrative Costs	154
5.7	The Antitrust Cost Curve	156
5.7.1	Building the Cost Curve	156
5.7.2	The Three-Stage Policy Framework Applicable to Vertical Agreements	161
5.7.3	Limitation of the Framework: Political Economy Distortions	164
5.8	Policy Recommendation for the EU and Brazil	165

Table of Contents

CHAPTER 6	
Conclusions	173
6.1 Summary of the Findings	173
6.2 Policy Recommendation	179
6.3 Future Research	182
References	185
Index	197