

# CROSS-BORDER PROTOCOLS IN INSOLVENCIES OF MULTINATIONAL ENTERPRISE GROUPS

**ILYA KOKORIN**

*PhD Researcher, Department of Financial Law, Leiden University, the Netherlands*

**BOB WESSELS**

*Professor Emeritus of International Insolvency Law, Leiden University, the Netherlands and  
Expert Advisor on Insolvency and Restructuring Law of the European Commission*

ELGAR CORPORATE AND INSOLVENCY LAW AND PRACTICE



Cheltenham, UK • Northampton, MA, USA

● Ilya Kokorin and Bob Wessels 2021

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical or photocopying, recording, or otherwise without the prior permission of the publisher.

Published by  
Edward Elgar Publishing Limited  
The Lypiatts  
15 Lansdown Road  
Cheltenham  
Glos GL50 2JA  
UK

Edward Elgar Publishing, Inc.  
William Pratt House  
9 Dewey Court  
Northampton  
Massachusetts 01060  
USA

A catalogue record for this book  
is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Control Number: 2021932443

This book is available electronically in the **Elgaronline**  
Law subject collection  
<http://dx.doi.org/10.4337/9781800880542>

Printed on elemental chlorine free (ECF)  
recycled paper containing 30% Post-Consumer Waste

ISBN 978 1 80088 053 5 (cased)  
ISBN 978 1 80088 054 2 (eBook)

Typeset by Columns Design XML Ltd, Reading

Printed and bound in the USA

# CONTENTS

<i>About the authors</i>	ix
<i>Preface</i>	xi
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xiv
<i>List of insolvency protocols</i>	xviii
<i>Table of cases</i>	xx
<i>Table of legislation</i>	xxiii
1. Introduction to <i>Cross-border Protocols in Insolvencies of Multinational Enterprise Groups</i>	1
2. The phenomenon of multinational enterprise groups	9
3. Insolvency of multinational enterprise groups	17
4. Cross-border insolvency protocols and agreements: Introduction and evolution	29
5. UNCITRAL and facilitation of cross-border insolvency cooperation: From entity to enterprise	53
6. European Insolvency Regulation (Recast) and group insolvencies	71
7. Legal nature of cross-border insolvency protocols	84
8. General features and limitations of insolvency protocols	101
9. Cross-border insolvency protocols and national law	122
10. Recommendations for use of insolvency protocols in group insolvencies	135
11. Bank insolvencies and cooperation agreements between resolution authorities	172
12. Recommendations for protocols in group insolvencies	186
13. Group insolvency protocol design	194
14. Annex	200
<i>Bibliography</i>	311
<i>Index</i>	323

# EXTENDED TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>About the authors</i>	ix
<i>Preface</i>	xi
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xiv
<i>List of insolvency protocols</i>	xviii
<i>Table of cases</i>	xx
<i>Table of legislation</i>	xxiii
1. INTRODUCTION TO CROSS-BORDER PROTOCOLS IN INSOLVENCIES OF MULTINATIONAL ENTERPRISE GROUPS	
2. THE PHENOMENON OF MULTINATIONAL ENTERPRISE GROUPS	
A. The rise of multinational enterprise groups	2.01
B. Definition of an enterprise group	2.08
C. Typology of enterprise groups	2.12
3. INSOLVENCY OF MULTINATIONAL ENTERPRISE GROUPS	
A. Entity-by-entity approach in insolvency law	3.01
B. Corporate group insolvency and ‘group insolvency solution’	3.08
1. Recognition of a corporate group in insolvency	3.08
2. The rise of ‘group insolvency solution’	3.14
3. The limits of ‘group insolvency solution’	3.19
4. CROSS-BORDER INSOLVENCY PROTOCOLS AND AGREEMENTS: INTRODUCTION AND EVOLUTION	
A. Purpose and goals of cross-border insolvency protocols and agreements	4.01
B. Early cases of cross-border insolvency protocols: Targeted crisis response	4.09
1. Macfadyen Protocol	4.09
2. Maxwell Protocol	4.13
3. Commodore Protocol	4.18
C. Cross-border Insolvency Concordat and early harmonization process	4.23
1. Principles of Cross-border Insolvency Concordat	4.23
2. Application of Concordat Principles in insolvency protocols	4.30
D. Loewen as a new model insolvency protocol	4.36
E. Evolution of cross-border insolvency protocols: Initial observations	4.42
5. UNCITRAL AND FACILITATION OF CROSS-BORDER INSOLVENCY COOPERATION: FROM ENTITY TO ENTERPRISE	
A. Model Law on cross-border insolvency 1997	5.01
B. Practice Guide on Cross-border Insolvency Cooperation 2009	5.11
C. Legislative Guide on Insolvency Law, Part III 2010	5.17
D. Model Law on Enterprise Group Insolvency 2019	5.25
1. Purpose and goals of Model Law 2019	5.25
2. Scope and tools of Model Law 2019	5.29
3. Model Law 2019 and insolvency agreements	5.34
6. EUROPEAN INSOLVENCY REGULATION (RECAST) AND GROUP INSOLVENCIES	
A. Background of EIR Recast and treatment of corporate groups in insolvency	6.01
B. EIR Recast and coordinated solution to group insolvencies	6.07

## EXTENDED TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. Cooperation and communication in group insolvencies	6.09
2. Group coordination proceeding	6.16
C. Cross-border insolvency protocols under EIR Recast	6.21
7. LEGAL NATURE OF CROSS-BORDER INSOLVENCY PROTOCOLS	
A. What are insolvency protocols?	7.01
1. Insolvency protocols and issue of jurisdiction	7.12
2. Insolvency protocols and issue of applicable law	7.19
B. Legal effect of insolvency protocols	7.31
8. GENERAL FEATURES AND LIMITATIONS OF INSOLVENCY PROTOCOLS	
A. Procedural principles and insolvency protocols	8.01
1. Procedural efficiency	8.03
2. Fair trial and procedural justice	8.07
3. Transparency and access to information	8.16
B. Compatibility with national law and EIR Recast Framework	8.30
1. Agreement on jurisdiction for claims against debtors	8.32
2. Agreement on COMI and jurisdiction for related actions	8.37
3. Agreement on law applicable to claims	8.41
C. Information exchange and conflicts of interest	8.45
9. CROSS-BORDER INSOLVENCY PROTOCOLS AND NATIONAL LAW	
A. Model Law 1997 and common law jurisdictions	9.01
B. Insolvency protocols and civil law jurisdictions	9.09
1. The Netherlands	9.09
2. Germany	9.13
3. Other jurisdictions	9.19
10. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR USE OF INSOLVENCY PROTOCOLS IN GROUP INSOLVENCIES	
A. Circumstances supporting conclusion of protocols	10.01
B. Securing protection or best realization of valuable assets	10.05
C. Participation rights and facilitation of group reorganization plans	10.13
1. Right to appear and be heard in group insolvency	10.13
2. Negotiation and implementation of group reorganization plans	10.17
D. Treatment of claims	10.23
1. Resolution of intra-group claims	10.23
2. Agreement concerning common set of financial accounting records	10.28
3. Special intercompany claim resolution mechanism	10.30
4. Agreements addressing coordination of claims and transactions	10.36
E. Supplementing existing cooperation frameworks	10.54
1. Group centralization and group governance in insolvency	10.57
2. Structuring of court-to-court communication	10.71
11. BANK INSOLVENCIES AND COOPERATION AGREEMENTS BETWEEN RESOLUTION AUTHORITIES	
A. From self-interest to close cooperation	11.01
B. Cooperation within resolution colleges and crisis management groups	11.05
C. Cooperation agreements between resolution authorities	11.10
12. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PROTOCOLS IN GROUP INSOLVENCIES	
13. GROUP INSOLVENCY PROTOCOL DESIGN	
14. ANNEX	
A. Maxwell Protocol	200
B. Commodore Protocol	208
C. Everfresh Protocol	217
D. Loewen Protocol	228
E. Inverworld Protocol	241
F. Pioneer Protocol	258

**EXTENDED TABLE OF CONTENTS**

---

G. Sento Protocol	268
H. Lehman Brothers Protocol	278
I. Madoff Protocol	291
J. Jet Airways Protocol	298
<i>Bibliography</i>	311
<i>Index</i>	323