

# The History and Growth of Judicial Review

*Volume 1:*

*The G-20 Common Law Countries and Israel*

STEVEN GOW CALABRESI

**OXFORD**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

**OXFORD**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford. It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship, and education by publishing worldwide. Oxford is a registered trade mark of Oxford University Press in the UK and certain other countries.

Published in the United States of America by Oxford University Press  
198 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016, United States of America.

© Steven Gow Calabresi 2021

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted by law, by license, or under terms agreed with the appropriate reproduction rights organization. Inquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the address above.

You must not circulate this work in any other form  
and you must impose this same condition on any acquirer.

---

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Calabresi, Steven Gow, editor.

Title: The history and growth of judicial review / Steven Gow Calabresi.

Description: New York : Oxford University Press, 2021. | Includes bibliographical references and index. |

Contents: Volume 1. The G-20 common law countries and Israel—Volume 2.

The G-20 civil law countries.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019054917 (print) | LCCN 2019054918 (ebook) |

ISBN 9780190075774 (v. 1; hardback) | ISBN 9780190075736 (v. 2; hardback) |

ISBN 9780190075798 (v. 1; epub) | ISBN 9780190075750 (v. 2; epub) |

ISBN 9780190075804 (v. 1; online) | ISBN 9780190075767 (v. 2; online) |

ISBN 9780190075781 (v. 1; updf) | ISBN 9780190075743 (v. 2; updf)

Subjects: LCSH: Judicial review.

Classification: LCC K3175 .H57 2020 (print) | LCC K3175 (ebook) |

DDC 347/.012—dc 23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019054917>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019054918>

---

DOI: 10.1093/oso/9780190075774.001.0001

1 3 5 7 9 8 6 4 2

Printed by Integrated Books International, United States of America

Note to Readers

This publication is designed to provide accurate and authoritative information in regard to the subject matter covered. It is based upon sources believed to be accurate and reliable and is intended to be current as of the time it was written. It is sold with the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering legal, accounting, or other professional services. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional person should be sought. Also, to confirm that the information has not been affected or changed by recent developments, traditional legal research techniques should be used, including checking primary sources where appropriate.

*(Based on the Declaration of Principles jointly adopted by a Committee of the American Bar Association and a Committee of Publishers and Associations.)*

You may order this or any other Oxford University Press publication  
by visiting the Oxford University Press website at [www.oup.com](http://www.oup.com).

# Detailed Contents

	<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
	Introduction: The Birth and Growth of Judicial Review: 1607–2020	1
Chapter 1	The Common Law Legal Tradition: First Things First	15
	I. The History of the Common Law Tradition	16
Chapter 2	The Diffuse and Second Look Models of Judicial Review	23
	I. The Diffuse Model of Judicial Review	24
	II. The Second Look Model of Judicial Review	28
Chapter 3	The Privy Council: The Umpire of the British Empire	35
	I. Jurisdiction, Powers, and the Role of the Privy Council in Providing Judicial Review between 1607 and 1776	35
	II. A History and Description of the Privy Council’s Role in the Thirteen North American Colonies	38
	A. Professor Mary Sarah Bilder’s Scholarship	39
	B. The Historical Origins of the Judicial Committee of the Privy Council	42
	C. The Monarchy and the Privy Council	44
	D. The Effect on the Colonies of the Abolition of the Court of Star Chamber	46
	E. A History of Privy Council Governance of the Thirteen North American Colonies	49
	1. Governance Prior to the Restoration of the Monarchy in 1660	50
	2. Governance from 1660 to 1684	50
	3. Governance from 1684 to 1776	56
	III. The Coming of the American Revolution	68
	IV. Gordon Wood: The Emergence of <i>Horizontal and         Enumerated Powers</i> Judicial Review between 1776 and 1787	74
	V. The Privy Council from 1783 to 1833	81
	VI. Reform of the Privy Council	82
	VII. The Decline of the Privy Council: 1875–1986	86
	VIII. The Ending of the Privy Council’s Jurisdiction	90

## X DETAILED CONTENTS

Chapter 4	The United States: Creation, Reconstruction, the Progressives, and the Modern Era	97
	I. The Privy Council Umpiring Origins of Vertical Judicial Review to Rein in Errant Colonies	101
	II. The Origins of U.S. Judicial Review from 1776 to 1803	102
	III. U.S. Judicial Review from 1789 to 1894	106
	A. Judicial Review in the Colonial and State Courts at the Founding	107
	B. The Constitution and the Bill of Rights: Fading Elite Hegemonic Preservation?	116
	IV. Judicial Review in the U.S. Supreme Court: 1789 to the Civil War to 1894	126
	A. Response to Professors Friedman and Delaney	127
	B. Judicial Review in the Wake of the Civil War: Rights from Wrongs, Elite Hegemonic Entrenchment, and Insurance and Commitment	140
	V. The Progressive Era and the Federal Courts: A Study in Elite Hegemonic Control	149
	A. Response to Professor Gillman	150
	B. The Transformation of the Republican Party	151
	C. The Rise of the Progressive Movement	153
	D. Woodrow Wilson and the Indian Summer of the Old Order	156
	E. President Franklin D. Roosevelt and the New Deal	158
	VI. Judicial Review in the United States from 1937 to 2020	161
	A. The Warren and Burger Courts	164
	B. The Rehnquist and Roberts Courts	167
	VII. Departmentalism, Judicial Supremacy, and Professor Whittington	169
	VIII. Conclusion	179
Chapter 5	Canada: From Privy Council to Supreme Court	183
	I. Constitutional History of Canada	188
	A. Canadian Constitutional History from 1608 until 1867	189
	B. The Canadian Federation from 1867 to 1931	194
	C. Canadian Independence 1931 to 1982	197
	D. The Constitution Act 1982 to the Present Day	199
	II. The Canadian Second Look Model of Judicial Review in Comparative Perspective	204
	III. Judicial Review in Canada: 1867–2020	208
	A. Federalism and Canadian Judicial Review	209
	B. Separation of Powers and Canadian Judicial Review	217
	C. More on Individual Rights and Canadian Judicial Review	219

Chapter 6	The Commonwealth of Australia: Umpiring without a Bill of Rights	229
	I. History of the Commonwealth of Australia	231
	A. The Constitutional Convention and the Setting Up of the High Court	232
	II. Judicial Review in Australia	244
Chapter 7	The Union of India: Umpiring and Rights from Wrongs	263
	I. History of the Union of India	265
	A. A Partial History of the Colonial Indian Judicial System in the Bombay High Court from 1862 to 1947	277
	B. Indian Independence: Sharp Break with the Past or an Evolutionary Constitutionalism?	278
	C. B. R. Ambedkar's (1891–1956) Central Role in Drafting the Indian Constitution	282
	D. Post-Independence History of Constitutional Dimensions	284
	E. The State of Emergency and Its Aftermath	289
	II. Judicial Review in the Union of India	292
	A. Jurisdiction of the Courts in India	302
	B. Abolition of Jury Trial in India	304
	III. What Explains the Origins and Growth of Judicial Review in India?	307
Chapter 8	The State of Israel	311
	I. History	312
	II. Judicial Review in Israel	319
	A. Judicial Review during the British Mandate	319
	B. Independence, the First Knesset, and the Harari Resolution	320
	C. 1951 to 1992—Israel as a Westminster-Style Democracy	324
	D. The Basic Law on Human Dignity, the Basic Law on Occupational Freedom, and the Bank <i>Hamizrahi</i> Decision	327
	III. The Origins and Growth of Israeli Judicial Review	332
	IV. Conclusion	334
Chapter 9	The Republic of South Africa	337
	I. History	338
	II. Judicial Review	352
	III. Origins and Growth of Judicial Review	360

## xii DETAILED CONTENTS

Chapter 10	The United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland: A Functional System of Second Look	
	Judicial Review	363
	I. History	366
	II. Judicial Review	373
	A. Judicially Enforced Bill of Rights	374
	B. Umpire in Federalism and Separation of Powers Cases	381
	III. The Origins and Growth of Judicial Review of Acts of Parliament	386
	IV. Conclusion	387
	Conclusion: The American and Westminster Models	391
	<i>Index</i>	397