

# Personalized Law

*Different Rules for Different People*

OMRI BEN SHAHAR

*Leo Herzl Professor of Law  
University of Chicago Law School*

ARIEL PORAT

*Alain Poher Professor of Law and President  
Tel-Aviv University*

**OXFORD**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# OXFORD

UNIVERSITY PRESS

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford. It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship, and education by publishing worldwide. Oxford is a registered trade mark of Oxford University Press in the UK and certain other countries.

Published in the United States of America by Oxford University Press  
198 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016, United States of America.

© Oxford University Press 2021

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted by law, by license, or under terms agreed with the appropriate reproduction rights organization. Inquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the address above.

You must not circulate this work in any other form  
and you must impose this same condition on any acquirer.

#### Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Ben-Shahar, Omri, author. | Porat, Ariel, author.

Title: Personalized law : different rules for different people / Omri Ben-Shahar, Leo Herzel Professor of Law, University of Chicago Law School and Ariel Porat, Alain Poher Professor of Law and President Tel-Aviv University.

Description: New York, NY : Oxford University Press, 2021. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2020055609 (print) | LCCN 2020055610 (ebook) | ISBN 9780197522813 (hardback) | ISBN 9780197522820 (updf) | ISBN 9780197522837 (epub) | ISBN 9780197522844 (online)

Subjects: LCSH: Law—Philosophy. | Obligations (Law) | Liability (Law) | Human rights. | Equality before the law. | Individual differences—Government policy.

Classification: LCC K258 .B46 2021 (print) | LCC K258 (ebook) | DDC 340/.1—dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2020055609>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2020055610>

DOI: 10.1093/oso/9780197522813.001.0001

1 3 5 7 9 8 6 4 2

Printed by Sheridan Books, Inc., United States of America

#### Note to Readers

This publication is designed to provide accurate and authoritative information in regard to the subject matter covered. It is based upon sources believed to be accurate and reliable and is intended to be current as of the time it was written. It is sold with the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering legal, accounting, or other professional services. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional person should be sought. Also, to confirm that the information has not been affected or changed by recent developments, traditional legal research techniques should be used, including checking primary sources where appropriate.

*(Based on the Declaration of Principles jointly adopted by a Committee of the American Bar Association and a Committee of Publishers and Associations.)*

You may order this or any other Oxford University Press publication  
by visiting the Oxford University Press website at [www.oup.com](http://www.oup.com).

# Table of Contents

<i>Preface</i>	xi
1. Introduction	1
Diary: A Day in the Life of David and Abigail	4
The Plan of the Book	13
PART I: INTRODUCING PERSONALIZED LAW	
2. What Is Personalized Law	19
Contextualization: The Old Precision Law	20
Personalization: The New Precision Law	23
Personalized Rules Everywhere	27
Self-Personalization	33
Personalization and the Objectives of the Law	35
Conclusion	37
3. The Precision Benefit	39
Personalized Everything	42
The Benefits of Personalization	45
The Benefits of Personalized Law	49
The Production Costs of Precision	53
Conclusion	57
PART II: PERSONALIZED LAW IN ACTION	
4. Personalized Legal Areas	61
Tort Law: The “Reasonable You”	61
Risk-Based Personalized Standards	64
Skill-Based Personalized Standards	67
Are Personalized Standards of Care Just?	69
Consumer Protection Law	71
Two Dimensions of Personalization: Value and Price	73
The Potential Pitfalls of Personalized Consumer Protections	75
Criminal Law	76
Benefit-Based Personalization	79
Detection-Based Personalization	80

## viii TABLE OF CONTENTS

5. Personalized Regulatory Techniques	85
Personalized Default Rules	85
Personalized Mandated Disclosures	92
Personalized Compensation	96
Personalized Bundles of Rights and Duties	99
6. Personalizing Rules by Age	105
Age as Input into Legal Commands	107
Age as Output of the Legal Command	112
Trouble with Using Age as Input	114

## PART III: PERSONALIZED LAW AND EQUALITY

7. Personalization and Distributive Justice	121
Personalized Rules and Relevant Criteria	122
Conflicts Between Distributive Justice Goals and Other Goals	125
Using Personalized Law to Advance Distributive Justice Goals	127
Personalized Law and Discrimination	132
Suspect Classifications	133
Data Echoing Historical Biases	136
Fixing Uniform Laws' Unequal Impact	138
8. Personalized Law and Equal Protection	143
The Constitutionality of Statistics	145
Individualized Treatment	150
Narrowly Tailored	152
Three Arguments for Differential Treatment	155
Disparate Impact	158
Conclusion	162

PART IV: IMPLEMENTATION OF  
PERSONALIZED LAW

9. Coordination	167
Coordination of Group Activity	169
Coordination of Individual Acts	173
Coordination and Information	177
Coordination as Participation	181
10. Manipulation	185
Distorted Investment in Human Capital	186
Pretending	190
Arbitrage	192

## TABLE OF CONTENTS ix

Ways to Restrain Manipulation	193
Immutable Characteristics	194
Hypothetical Characteristics	194
The Numerosity of Characteristics and Commands	195
Preventing Arbitrage	198
11. Governing Through Data	201
What Information is Required for Lawmaking?	202
Where will the Information Come From?	207
Obeying Personalized Commands	213
Privacy and Data Protection	216
People's Interests in Privacy	216
Society's Interest in Data Protection	218
12. Conclusion: Legal Robotics	223
Law and Artificial Intelligence	225
The Human Design	231
Tomorrow Morning	238
<i>Index</i>	243