

Land and Forest Rights of Amazonian Indigenous Peoples from a National and International Perspective

*A Legal Comparison of the National Norms of Bolivia,
Brazil, Ecuador, and Peru*

By

Siu Lang Carrillo Yap



BRILL
NIJHOFF

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Carrillo Yap, Siu Lang, 1976- author.

Title: Land and forest rights of Amazonian Indigenous peoples from a national and international perspective : a legal comparison of the national norms of Bolivia, Brazil, Ecuador, and Peru / by Siu Lang Carrillo Yap.

Description: Leiden ; Boston : BrillNijhoff, [2022] | Series: Studies in international minority and group rights, 2210-2132 ; volume 16 | Based on author's thesis (doctoral – Universität Göttingen, 2020). | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2021049582 (print) | LCCN 2021049583 (ebook) | ISBN 9789004439382 (hardback) | ISBN 9789004439399 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Indians of South America—Legal status, laws, etc.—Amazon River Watershed. | Forestry law and legislation—Amazon River Watershed. | Indians of South America—Land tenure—Amazon River Watershed.

Classification: LCC KH772 .C37 2022 (print) | LCC KH772 (ebook) | DDC 346.804/675—dc23/ENG/20211223

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021049582>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021049583>

1211151

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 2210-2132

ISBN 978-90-04-43938-2 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-43939-9 (e-book)

Copyright 2022 by Siu Lang Carrillo Yap. Published by Koninklijke Brill nv, Leiden, The Netherlands. Koninklijke Brill nv incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Hotei, Brill Schönigh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau and V&R unipress. Koninklijke Brill nv reserves the right to protect this publication against unauthorized use. Requests for re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill nv via brill.com or copyright.com.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

Contents

Acknowledgements	IX
German and Spanish Summaries (<i>Zusammenfassung/Resumen</i>)	X
List of Tables and Graphics	XIV
List of Abbreviations and Acronyms	XV
1 Introduction: Conflicts Because of Lands and Forests – the Challenging Relation between Amazonian Indigenous Peoples and Their Nation States	1
1.1 Structure of the Book	6
1.2 Method	7
2 Setting the Scene	11
2.1 The Amazonian Region as a Geographical Place	11
2.2 Amazonian Indigenous Peoples	12
2.2.1 <i>Indigenous Peoples</i>	13
2.2.2 <i>Amazonian Indigenous Peoples</i>	16
2.3 Community Forest Management as a Form of Use of Forest Resources	18
3 Establishing the Legal Standards: Rights of Indigenous Peoples at the International Level	22
3.1 Development of Indigenous Rights in International Law	22
3.2 Rights of Indigenous Peoples at the International Level	25
3.2.1 <i>Right to Self-Determination</i>	26
3.2.2 <i>Rights to the Territories, Lands, and Natural Resources</i>	36
3.3 Binding Character of International Agreements Referred to Indigenous Peoples (ILO Convention 169, UNDRIP and Biodiversity Convention)	54
3.3.1 <i>The International Agreements in the Bolivian Legal System</i>	57
3.3.2 <i>The International Agreements in the Brazilian Legal System</i>	57
3.3.3 <i>The International Agreements in the Ecuadorian Legal System</i>	61
3.3.4 <i>The International Agreements in the Peruvian Legal System</i>	61
3.4 Conclusions	64

4	Relationship between the Nation States and Indigenous Peoples	72
4.1	Historical Appraisal of Citizenship Regimes: Citizens, Non-citizens and People under Guardianship Regime	72
4.1.1	<i>Recognition of Indigenous Peoples as Citizens</i>	73
4.1.2	<i>Recognition of the Rights of Indigenous Peoples as Such in the Constitutions</i>	81
4.1.3	<i>Recognition of the Legal Existence of Indigenous Communities</i>	84
4.2	Indigenous Peoples in the Current Legal Systems	86
4.2.1	<i>Transformative and Preservative Constitutions</i>	86
4.2.2	<i>The “Names” of the Indigenous Communities</i>	97
4.2.3	<i>Guardianship Regime in the Present</i>	101
4.3	Conclusions of the Chapter	103
5	Rights of Amazonian Indigenous Peoples to the Lands and Territories	111
5.1	Historical Appraisal: The Long Road for Amazonian Indigenous Peoples to Recover Their Rights over Lands and Territories	113
5.1.1	<i>Land Rights of Indigenous Peoples during the Colony</i>	113
5.1.2	<i>Land Rights of Indigenous Peoples after the Independence</i>	117
5.2	Rights to the Lands in the Current Constitutions and National Laws	139
5.2.1	<i>Permanent Possession Rights over All Types of Lands (Brazil)</i>	139
5.2.2	<i>Ownership Rights over Agricultural Lands and Settlements, Use Rights over Forest Lands (Peru)</i>	154
5.2.3	<i>Autonomous Territories and Ownership Rights over All Types of Lands (Bolivia and Ecuador)</i>	164
5.3	Conclusions of the Chapter	199
6	Rights of Indigenous Peoples to the Forest Resources	212
6.1	Historical Appraisal of the Forest Rights of Indigenous Peoples	212
6.2	Key Features of the Forest Norms	218
6.2.1	<i>Forest Resources Are under the Control of the Nation States</i>	218
6.2.2	<i>Decentralization of Decision-Making Over Forest Resources</i>	222
6.2.3	<i>The Precarious Balance between Use and Conservation of Forest Resources</i>	228

6.3	Rights over Forest Resources	231
6.3.1	<i>Rights over Forest Resources in the Constitutions and National Laws</i>	231
6.3.2	<i>Analysis of the Content of the Rights over Forest Resources</i>	235
6.3.3	<i>Limitations on Forest Rights</i>	241
6.4	Conclusions of the Chapter	243
7	Community Forest Management (CFM)	250
7.1	Definition of Community Forest Management	250
7.2	CFM and Traditional Forest-Related Knowledge	252
7.2.1	<i>Definition of Traditional Forest-Related Knowledge</i>	253
7.2.2	<i>Recognition of Indigenous Peoples' Rights over Traditional Knowledge in the National Norms</i>	255
7.3	CFM before the Enactment of the Current Norms	261
7.4	Current Regulation of CFM	263
7.4.1	<i>Holder of the Title for Practicing CFM</i>	263
7.4.2	<i>Conditions for Implementing CFM</i>	266
7.4.3	<i>Support and Promotion of CFM</i>	319
7.5	Conclusions of the Chapter	320
8	Evaluation and Summary	328
8.1	Implementing International Law in the National Legal Systems of Bolivia, Brazil, Ecuador and Peru	332
8.1.1	<i>Partial Recognition of the Right to Self-Determination</i>	332
8.1.2	<i>Separate Recognition of the Rights to Land, Territories and Natural Resources</i>	335
8.2	Strengthening the Lands and Forests Rights of Amazonian Indigenous Peoples for the Conservation of the Amazon Rainforest	341
8.2.1	<i>Revisiting the Right to Self-Determination Implemented in Indigenous Territorial Units</i>	342
8.2.2	<i>Establishing a Common System of Regulation of Lands and Forests of Amazonian Indigenous Peoples: The View of Property Law Theory Supported by Natural Sciences</i>	345
	References	365
	Index	398