

Law, War and the Penumbra of Uncertainty

LEGAL CULTURES, EXTRA-LEGAL REASONING
AND THE USE OF FORCE

SAM SELVADURAI

King's College, University of London



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316511985

DOI: 10.1017/9781009051934

© Samuel Dayalan Selvadurai 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

A *catalogue record* for this publication is *available from the British Library*.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Selvadurai, Sam, author.

TITLE: Law, war and the penumbra of uncertainty : legal cultures, extra-legal reasoning and the use of force / Sam Selvadurai, King's College University of London.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2021. | Based on author's thesis (doctoral – King's College London, 2020) issued under title: Law, war and the penumbra of uncertainty : legal and factual uncertainty and extra-legal reasoning in the jus ad bellum. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2021045498 (print) | LCCN 2021045499 (ebook) | ISBN 9781316511985 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009051934 (ebook)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: War (International law) | Legal certainty.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC KZ6385 S45 2021 (print) | LCC KZ6385 (ebook) | DDC 341.6–dc23/cng/20220131

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2021045498>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2021045499>

ISBN 978-1-316-51198-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	page	xiii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>		xv
1 Introduction: Investigating Law, War and the Penumbra of Uncertainty		
Introduction		
Legal and Extra-legal Controversy in the <i>Jus Ad Bellum</i>		4
Investigating Legal and Factual Uncertainty about Resort to War		9
Outline of the Book		16
PART I VARIETIES OF UNCERTAINTY IN THE JUS AD BELLUM		21
2 Uncertainty about Law in the <i>Jus Ad Bellum</i>		23
Introduction		23
Vagueness and Disagreement in Law		24
Uncertainty in Identifying and Interpreting the <i>Jus Ad Bellum</i>		34
‘Hard Cases’ in the <i>Jus Ad Bellum</i>		44
Interpretive Principles and the <i>Jus Ad Bellum</i>		57
Conclusion: Competing Interpretive Cultures		63
3 Uncertainty about Facts in the <i>Jus Ad Bellum</i>		68
Introduction		68
Facts and Forecasts in the <i>Jus Ad Bellum</i>		69
Hercules, Thrasymachus and the Confounding Effects of Factual Detail		82
Responses in Law to Uncertainty of Fact		89
Extra-Legal Reasoning in the <i>Jus Ad Bellum</i>		99
Conclusion: Competing Strategic Cultures		106

PART II THE INTERNATIONAL COURT OF JUSTICE, UK-BASED LAWYERS AND THE JUS AD BELLUM	111
4 Competing Interpretive Cultures of War	113
Introduction	113
Legal Scholars and Legal Interpretation: Kosovo, Afghanistan and Iraq	117
Introduction	117
Narrative	121
Conclusions	128
The ICJ and Legal Interpretation: Nicaragua, Wall, Congo	129
Introduction	129
Narrative	131
Conclusions	143
UK International Lawyers and Legal Interpretation	145
Introduction	145
Narrative	146
Conclusions	155
Conclusion	158
5 Competing Strategic Cultures of Law	161
Introduction	161
Legal Scholars and Extra-legal Reasoning: Kosovo, Afghanistan and Iraq	165
Introduction	165
Narrative	166
Conclusions	174
The ICJ and Extra-legal Reasoning: <i>Nicaragua, Wall and Congo</i>	176
Introduction	176
Narrative	176
Conclusions	186
UK International Lawyers and Extra-legal Reasoning	189
Introduction	189
Narrative	194
Conclusions	204
Conclusion	209

PART III MANAGING UNCERTAINTY: RECONCILING LEGAL AND EXTRA-LEGAL REASONING	215
6 Legal Risk, Strategic Assessment, Forecasting and the <i>Jus Ad Bellum</i>	217
Introduction	217
Three Approaches to Uncertainty	220
Legal Risk Management	220
International Humanitarian Law	222
Strategic Intelligence Analysis and Forecasting	223
A Risk Management Framework for the <i>Jus Ad Bellum</i>	225
Applying the Framework: Kosovo and Afghanistan	238
Kosovo 1999	238
Afghanistan 2001	248
Conclusion	257
Iraq 2003: Legal Risk Management in (Imperfect) Action?	258
Conclusion	262
7 Uncertainty, Risk Management and Duty to the Law	264
Introduction	264
Varying Duties and Roles of International Lawyers	265
Uncertainty and Challenges to Lawyers' Duty to the Law	275
Justifying a Risk Management Approach	291
Conclusion: Reflective Equilibrium and Hard Cases	303
8 Conclusion: Competing Normative Cultures of War	310
Introduction	310
Recapitulation: Argument, Findings and Conclusions	311
Methodological Limitations, Future Opportunities	318
Conclusion: Determinacy and Efficacy in the <i>Jus Ad Bellum</i>	324
<i>Bibliography</i>	331
Primary Materials	331
Anonymised List of Interview and Survey Participants	331
Official Government and Parliamentary Documents	332
Treaties and UN Documents	334
Court Judgments and Opinions	336

Later Works	338
Academic Articles	338
Books	344
Internet Resources	350
Images	352
<i>Index</i>	353