

Duality of Responsibility in International Law

The Individual, the State, and International Crimes

By

Thomas Weatherall



BRILL
NIJHOFF

LEIDEN | BOSTON

The Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data is available online at <https://catalog.loc.gov>
LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021062734>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 2405-6847

ISBN 978-90-04-50536-0 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-50537-7 (e-book)

Copyright 2022 by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Hotei, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau and V&R unipress.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher. Requests for re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill NV via brill.com or copyright.com.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

Contents

Foreword	XI
Preface	XIV
Abbreviations	XIX
About the Author	XX
Table of Cases	XXI

Introduction	1
--------------	---

PART 1

Parameters of Responsibility

1	Subjects of Responsibility under International Law	11
	a The State as a Subject of International Law	11
	b The Individual as a Subject of International Law	17
	c Duality of Responsibility in International Law	30
2	Primary and Secondary Rules	36
	a Primary Rules	38
	i <i>Individual-Directed Rules</i>	38
	ii <i>State-Directed Rules</i>	46
	b Secondary Rules	53
	i <i>Distinguishing Secondary Rules of Individual and State Responsibility</i>	53
	ii <i>Secondary Rules of Individual Responsibility</i>	58
	iii <i>Secondary Rules of State Responsibility</i>	58
	iv <i>Associated Secondary Rules</i>	59

PART 2

Breach

3	Crimes under International Law	65
	a Elements of Individual Criminal Responsibility	65
	i <i>The Objective Element</i>	66
	ii <i>The Subjective Element</i>	68
	b An Element Approach to Crimes	74

- 4 **Internationally Wrongful Acts** 76
 - a Elements of State Responsibility 76
 - b Two Categories of Primary Rules 77
 - c Concurrent State Responsibility 81
 - i *Peremptory Norms and Their Correlates* 81
 - ii *Acta Jure Imperii* 86
 - iii *Crimes of States* 87
 - iv *Aggravated State Responsibility* 90
 - d Complementary State Responsibility 94
 - i *Obligations Erga Omnes* 94
 - ii *Implications of Distinct Primary Rules* 96

- 5 **Breach and the Interaction of Primary and Secondary Rules** 105
 - a Relationship between Elements of Individual and State Responsibility 105
 - b Sources of Law 113
 - c Standards of Proof 117

PART 3

Attribution

- 6 **Rules of Attribution in International Criminal Law** 133
 - a Modes of Attribution 133
 - i *Commission* 135
 - ii *Encouragement* 142
 - iii *Assistance* 149
 - iv *Superior Responsibility* 155
 - v *Inchoate Offences* 162
 - b Conclusions 168
 - i *Relevance to Attribution in the Law of State Responsibility* 169
 - ii *Identifying the Parameters of Modes of Attribution* 171
 - iii *Methodology and Sources of Law* 173

- 7 **Rules of Attribution in the Law of State Responsibility** 178
 - a Modes of Attribution 179
 - i *State Organs* 179
 - ii *De Facto State Organs* 182
 - iii *Ultra Vires Conduct* 185

- iv *Other Circumstances in which Conduct may be Attributable to the State* 188
 - b Conclusions 194
 - i *Secondary Rules of General Applicability* 195
 - ii *Actions and Omissions* 197
- 8 **Convergence and Divergence in Attribution** 202
 - a Principles of Attribution: Culpability and Objectivity Distinguished 202
 - b Double Attribution 207
 - c International Crimes, Official Capacity, and Attribution to the State 215
 - d Crimes under International Law Performed in a Private Capacity 221
 - e Attribution to the State and Individual Immunity *Ratione Materiae* 224

PART 4

Responsibility

- 9 **Consequences** 231
 - a Consequences of Individual Criminal Responsibility 231
 - i *Purposes* 231
 - ii *Penalties* 235
 - b Consequences of an Internationally Wrongful Act 237
 - i *Consequences for the Responsible State* 237
 - ii *Consequences beyond the Responsible State* 245
 - iii *Standing* 249
 - c Differentiation in Forms of Responsibility and their Consequences 254
- 10 **Defenses** 261
 - a Exclusion of Responsibility for Crimes under International Law 261
 - i *Failure of Proof* 262
 - ii *Justification and Excuse* 265
 - b Circumstances Precluding Wrongfulness for Internationally Wrongful Acts 269
 - c Points of Contact in Avoidance of Responsibility 272

- 11 **Jurisdiction** 279
 - a Jurisdiction over Individuals under International Law 279
 - b Jurisdiction over States under International Law 284
 - c Divergence in Rules of Jurisdiction 286

- 12 **Immunity** 290
 - a Immunity of Individuals under International Law 290
 - i *Immunity Ratione Personae* 290
 - ii *Immunity Ratione Materiae* 295
 - iii *Inviolability* 304
 - b State Immunity under International Law 307
 - c Corresponding Divergence in Rules of Immunity 310

PART 5

Duality of Responsibility in International Law

- 13 **The Legal Framework of Duality of Responsibility** 317
 - a Individual Responsibility 318
 - b State Responsibility 324
 - c The Relationship between Individual and State Responsibility 335
 - i *Breach* 336
 - ii *Attribution* 338
 - iii *Responsibility* 341

- 14 **Conclusions** 345

- Index** 353