

# The Insanity Defence

*International and Comparative Perspectives*

*Edited by*

RONNIE MACKAY AND WARREN BROOKBANKS

OXFORD  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

**OXFORD**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Great Clarendon Street, Oxford, OX2 6DP,  
United Kingdom

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford.  
It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship,  
and education by publishing worldwide. Oxford is a registered trade mark of  
Oxford University Press in the UK and in certain other countries

© The multiple contributors 2022

The moral rights of the authors have been asserted

First Edition published in 2022

Impression: 1

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in  
a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the  
prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted  
by law, by licence or under terms agreed with the appropriate reprographics  
rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the  
above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the  
address above

You must not circulate this work in any other form  
and you must impose this same condition on any acquirer

Public sector information reproduced under Open Government Licence v3.0  
(<http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/open-government-licence.htm>)

Published in the United States of America by Oxford University Press  
198 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016, United States of America

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

Data available

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Data available

ISBN 978-0-19-885494-4

DOI: 10.1093/oso/9780198854944.001.0001

Printed and bound by

CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY

Links to third party websites are provided by Oxford in good faith and  
for information only. Oxford disclaims any responsibility for the materials  
contained in any third party website referenced in this work.

# Contents

<i>Table of Cases</i>	xi
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xxi
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xxvii
<i>List of Contributors</i>	xxix
1. Introduction	1
<i>Ronnie Mackay and Warren Brookbanks</i>	
2. The Insanity Defence in English Law	21
<i>Ronnie Mackay</i>	
3. Reforming the Insanity Defence in England and Wales	45
<i>David Ormerod and Mark Dsouza</i>	
4. The Mental Disorder Defence in Scots Law	72
<i>Gerry Maher</i>	
5. The Insanity Defence in Irish Law	100
<i>Paul McCutcheon</i>	
6. The Mental Disorder Defence: Canadian Law and Practice	122
<i>Gerry Ferguson</i>	
7. The Insanity Defence: Conflict and Reform in New Zealand	144
<i>Warren Brookbanks</i>	
8. The Insanity Defence under Australian Law	170
<i>Ian Freckelton</i>	
9. Before and After Hinckley: Legal Insanity in the United States	199
<i>Stephen J Morse</i>	
10. The Insanity Defence in French Law: Are Prisons the ‘New Asylums’?	223
<i>Audrey Guinchard</i>	
11. Insanity in German Criminal Law	247
<i>Regina E Rauxloh</i>	
12. Legal Insanity in the Netherlands: Regulations and Reflections	274
<i>Gerben Meynen</i>	

## X CONTENTS

13. Criminal Insanity in Norwegian Law <i>Linda Gröning</i>	295
14. The Insanity Defence in China <i>Lilou Jiang</i>	316
15. The Insanity Defence under International Criminal Law <i>Ian Freckelton and Magda Karagiannakis</i>	334
16. Conclusion <i>Ronnie Mackay and Warren Brookbanks</i>	355
<i>Index</i>	371