

# WE, THE ROBOTS?

Regulating Artificial Intelligence and  
the Limits of the Law

SIMON CHESTERMAN

*National University of Singapore*



**CAMBRIDGE**  
**UNIVERSITY PRESS**

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,  
New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of  
education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781316517680](http://www.cambridge.org/9781316517680)

DOI: 10.1017/9781009047081

© Simon Chesterman 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

Names: Chesterman, Simon, author.

Title: We, the robots? : regulating artificial intelligence and the limits of the law / Simon  
Chesterman, National University of Singapore.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY, USA : Cambridge University  
Press, 2021. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2021010083 (print) | LCCN 2021010084 (ebook) | ISBN 9781316517680  
(hardcover) | ISBN 9781009048316 (paperback) | ISBN 9781009047081 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Artificial intelligence – Law and legislation.

Classification: LCC K564.C6 C44 2021 (print) | LCC K564.C6 (ebook) |  
DDC 343.09/99–dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2021010083>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2021010084>

ISBN 978-1-316-51768-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of  
URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication  
and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,  
accurate or appropriate.

## CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	xv
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xvii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xix
Introduction	1
Outline of the Book	6
Precaution vs Innovation	10
<b>PART I Challenges</b>	<b>13</b>
1 Speed	15
1.1 The Globalization of Information	18
1.2 High-Frequency Trading	21
1.3 Competition Law	25
1.4 The Problem with Speed	28
2 Autonomy	31
2.1 Driverless Cars and the Management of Risk	33
2.1.1 Civil Liability	36
2.1.2 Criminal Law	38
2.1.3 Ethics	41
2.2 Killer Robots and the Morality of Outsourcing	44
2.2.1 International Humanitarian Law	46
2.2.2 Human-out-of-the-Loop?	48
2.2.3 Lessons from Mercenaries	51

2.3	Algorithmic Decision-Making and Legitimacy	53
2.3.1	Contracts and Knowledge	55
2.3.2	Automated Processing	57
2.4	The Problem with Autonomy	60
3	Opacity	63
3.1	Inferior Decisions	67
3.2	Impermissible Decisions	69
3.2.1	How Bias Is Learned	70
3.2.2	Unlearning Bias	74
3.3	Illegitimate Decisions	75
3.3.1	Public Decisions	76
3.3.2	Courts	79
3.4	The Problem with Opacity	81
<b>PART II Tools</b>		<b>83</b>
4	Responsibility	85
4.1	Managing Risk	87
4.1.1	Negligence	88
4.1.2	Strict Liability	91
4.1.3	Product Liability	93
4.1.4	Insurance	97
4.2	Non-delegable Duties	101
4.2.1	Non-delegable Duties in the Common Law	101
4.2.2	Command Responsibility	103
4.2.3	The Buck Stops Here	109
4.3	Inherently Governmental Functions and the Limits of Outsourcing	109
4.4	The Limits of Responsibility	112
5	Personality	114
5.1	A Body to Kick?	116
5.1.1	Theories of Juridical Personality	117

## CONTENTS

xi

5.1.2	The Content of Legal Personality	119
	(a) Private Law	120
	(b) Criminal Law	123
5.1.3	No Soul to Be Damned	125
5.2	Cogito, Ergo Sum?	126
5.2.1	The Extension of Natural Personality	128
5.2.2	Rewarding Creativity	131
5.2.3	Protecting Inventors	135
5.3	Constraining Superintelligence	138
5.4	The Limits of Personality	141
6	Transparency	144
6.1	In Theory	146
6.1.1	What?	147
6.1.2	When?	148
6.1.3	To Whom?	149
6.1.4	At What Cost?	150
6.2	In Practice	151
6.2.1	Methods	151
6.2.2	Tools	154
	(a) Algorithmic Impact Assessments	154
	(b) Algorithmic Audits	156
	(c) AI Ombudsperson	157
6.3	In Law	158
6.3.1	An EU Right to Explanation?	158
6.3.2	Council of Europe Convention 108	162
6.3.3	France	162
6.3.4	United States	163
6.3.5	Canada	164
6.3.6	Other Jurisdictions	165
6.4	The Limits of Transparency	166
<b>PART III Possibilities</b>		<b>171</b>
7	New Rules	173
7.1	Why (Not) Regulate?	177

7.2	When to Regulate	180
7.2.1	The Precautionary Principle	182
7.2.2	Masterly Inactivity	184
7.3	How to Regulate	185
7.3.1	Managed Risks	187
7.3.2	Red Lines	188
7.3.3	Process Legitimacy	190
7.4	The Prospects for Rules	192
8	New Institutions	195
8.1	Industry Standards	198
8.1.1	Common Language, Best Practice	200
8.1.2	Perverse Incentives, Regulatory Capture	202
8.2	Global Red Lines	203
8.2.1	Structural Challenges	204
	(a) Norms	205
	(b) Attribution	207
	(c) Consequences	208
8.2.2	An International Artificial Intelligence Agency?	209
	(a) Bargain	212
	(b) Authority	213
	(c) Structure	216
8.3	State Responsibility	217
8.3.1	Legislature	218
8.3.2	Executive	218
8.3.3	Judiciary	219
8.3.4	An AI Ombudsperson?	220
8.4	The Prospects for Institutions	222
9	Regulation <i>by</i> AI?	224
9.1	Automating the Law	227
9.1.1	The Inner Illogic of the Law	230
9.1.2	In Fact	232
9.2	Law as Data	234

## CONTENTS

xiii

9.3 Law as Code	236
9.3.1 Regulation by Design	237
9.3.2 Regulation by Debugging	238
9.4 The Prospects for Regulation	240
Conclusion: We, the Robots?	243
<i>Bibliography</i>	247
<i>Index</i>	280