# Artificial Justice

TATIANA DANCY



### OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS

#### Great Clarendon Street, Oxford, OX2 6DP, United Kingdom

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford.

It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship, and education by publishing worldwide. Oxford is a registered trade mark of Oxford University Press in the UK and in certain other countries

© Tatiana Dancy 2023

The moral rights of the author have been asserted

First Edition published in 2023

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted by law, by licence or under terms agreed with the appropriate reprographics rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the address above

You must not circulate this work in any other form and you must impose this same condition on any acquirer

 $Public sector information reproduced under Open Government \ Licence v3.0 \\ (http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/open-government-licence.htm) \\$ 

Published in the United States of America by Oxford University Press 198 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016, United States of America

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

Data available

Library of Congress Control Number: 2023944490

ISBN 978-0-19-284689-1

DOI: 10.1093/oso/9780192846891.001.0001

Printed and bound by CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY

Links to third party websites are provided by Oxford in good faith and for information only. Oxford disclaims any responsibility for the materials contained in any third party website referenced in this work.



## Contents

1.	Introduction	1
	The English Convict	1
	Statistical Algorithms	5
	Algorithmic Justice	7
	Relevance	9
	Equality	11
	Choice	13
2.	Relevance	21
	The Fire Tells the Story	21
	The Lure of Blame	27
	The Phantom of Heilbronn	33
3.	Equality	41
	Guilty as Sin	41
	Puzzle People	45
	A Big Honking Book	48
	Guinea-Chasing Treatments	51
	Bumps in Boston	54
	The Quirky Guy from the Morgue	58
4.	Choice	71
	Born Criminal	71
	An Ideal Crime-Fighting World	78
	Relentless Pursuit	86
	The Worst-Case Scenario	90
	Every Parent's Nightmare	97
	A Blizzard of Prescriptions	100
5.	Transparency	115
	A Chilling Conclusion	115
	The Determinative Factor	118
6.	Concluding Remarks	129
	Summary	129
	The English Convict	132
	Algorithmic Justice	134
	The Value of Choice	137

### STJ00120342

### vi CONTENTS

Criminal Justice	139
Transparency	140
Policy and Prediction	142
Conclusion	144
Index	149