

The Rule of Law in Brazil
*The Legal Construction of
Inequality*

Juliano Zaiden Benvindo

• H A R T •

OXFORD • LONDON • NEW YORK • NEW DELHI • SYDNEY

STJ00120335

HART PUBLISHING

Bloomsbury Publishing Plc

Kemp House, Chawley Park, Cumnor Hill, Oxford, OX2 9PH, UK

1385 Broadway, New York, NY 10018, USA

29 Earlsfort Terrace, Dublin 2, Ireland

HART PUBLISHING, the Hart/Stag logo, BLOOMSBURY and the Diana logo are trademarks of Bloomsbury Publishing Plc

First published in Great Britain 2022

First published in hardback, 2022

Paperback edition, 2024

Copyright © Juliano Zaiden Benvindo, 2022

Juliano Zaiden Benvindo has asserted his right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 to be identified as Author of this work.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers.

While every care has been taken to ensure the accuracy of this work, no responsibility for loss or damage occasioned to any person acting or refraining from action as a result of any statement in it can be accepted by the authors, editors or publishers.

All UK Government legislation and other public sector information used in the work is Crown Copyright ©. All House of Lords and House of Commons information used in the work is Parliamentary Copyright ©. This information is reused under the terms of the Open Government Licence v3.0 (<http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/version/3>) except where otherwise stated.

All Eur-lex material used in the work is © European Union, <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/>, 1998–2024.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

Library of Congress Control Number: 2022934803

ISBN: PB: 978-1-50996-190-0

ePDF: 978-1-50993-497-3

ePub 978-1-50993-496-6

Typeset by Compuscript Ltd, Shannon

To find out more about our authors and books visit www.hartpublishing.co.uk
Here you will find extracts, author information, details of forthcoming events
and the option to sign up for our newsletters.

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>vii</i>
Introduction	1
I. What Happened to the Brazil that was ‘Taking ●ff’?.....	1
II. The Structure of this Book	7
1. The Conceptual Evolution of the Rule of Law in Brazil	14
I. Introduction: A Prosaic Approach to the Rule of Law	14
II. Democracy and Social Justice in the Core of the Rule of Law: A Normative Dispute?	19
III. Estado de Direito in Brazil: Between Preservation and Democratisation.....	22
IV. Estado de Direito in Brazil: Social Inequality as a Hindrance to Coordination	26
V. The Rule of Law and Coordination in Unequal Societies.....	28
2. The Local Lived Experiences of the Rule of Law in Brazil: The Impacts of Social Inequality	31
I. Introduction: A Persistent Inequality	31
II. Brazil and its Longstanding Struggle with Social Inequality	33
III. Inclusiveness and Historical Inequalities in Brazil.....	39
A. Racial Inequality.....	39
B. Gender Inequality	45
C. Indigenous People	50
D. Regional Inequalities.....	54
IV. Inequality and Brazil’s Declining Rule of Law	59
3. The Authoritarian Mindset and the Rule of Law in Brazil	63
I. Introduction: Hobsbawm’s ●men and the Authoritarian Mindset in Brazil.....	63
II. The Theoretical Justification of the Authoritarian Mindset: The Three Main Pillars	66
III. The Reinvention of the Authoritarian Mindset in History	67
A. The Authoritarian Mindset in Authoritarian Regimes	67
B. The Authoritarian Mindset in the Awakening of Democracy: A Clash of Narratives	71
C. The Authoritarian Mindset and the Revival of the Military under Jair Bolsonaro.....	78

IV.	The Reinvention of the Authoritarian Mindset after Years of Democratic Life	84
4.	The Rule of Law and Brazilian Political Institutions: A Reshaped ‘Coalition Presidentialism’	87
I.	Introduction: Some Cautionary Remarks About the Brazilian Political System	87
II.	The Brazilian Political System: Efficiency or Deep Dysfunctionality?	92
A.	A Strong Presidentialism?	92
B.	A Highly Fragmented and Oligarchical Congress	98
C.	Clientelism and ‘Coalition Presidentialism’: A Necessary Correlation?	103
III.	A Reshaped ‘Coalition Presidentialism’	110
5.	The Rule of Law and Brazil’s Politicised Judicial System	113
I.	Introduction: The Judiciary in a Country in Crisis	113
II.	The Judiciary’s Constitutional Design	116
A.	The Federal, State and Specialised Courts	116
B.	The Federal Supreme Court	120
C.	The ‘Ancillary’ Institutions of Justice: The Public Ministry, the Advocacy-General of the Union and the Public Defender’s Office	129
III.	A More Accessible, Though Still Unaccountable, Judiciary and the Increasing Culture of Rights	132
IV.	Privileges and the Judicial System: The Judiciary as a Blatant Illustration of Brazil’s Inequality	135
V.	Criminal Justice and Police Forces	138
6.	The Extra-Legal Influences on the Rule of Law and Mechanisms of Accountability in Brazil	146
I.	Introduction: The Paradoxical Relationship Between the Private and Public Sectors in Brazil	146
II.	The Data of Corruption in Brazil According to International Indicators	148
III.	The Combat of Corruption in Brazil: The Effects of Path Dependence, Inequality, and Institutional Design Flaws	153
IV.	Accountability Institutions, Incremental Improvements in Combatting Corruption and Political Backlash: Two Steps Forward, One Step Back?	157
A.	Accountability Institutions	157
B.	The Expected Political Backlash	160
V.	The Organised Civil Society and the Quest for Fairness Amidst Self-Preservation Movements: A Permanent Struggle	163

VI.	A Free and Independent Media?.....	168
	A. The Media as a Key Player in Brazilian Democracy and in its Backsliding	168
	B. The Power of the New Media: Fake News as the New Normal	174
7.	The Rule of Law in Brazil and the Challenges of International Law	179
	I. Introduction: Brazil as a Soft Power?.....	179
	II. The Rule of Law in Brazil and International Law: Impacts on the Domestic Level	181
	III. Brazil and Regional Integration: The MERCOSUR	186
	IV. Brazil and International Tribunals: The Inter-American Court of Human Rights	191
	V. The International Perception of Brazil's Compliance with the Rule of Law	195
8.	The Future of the Rule of Law in Brazil	198
	I. The Destabilising Factors of the Rule of Law in Brazil	198
	A. The Growing Polarisation in Society and Politics.....	200
	B. The Disarrangement of the Political and Judicial Systems.....	202
	C. A New 'Equilibrium'?	203
	II. The Future of Brazil's Rule of Law	207
	<i>Bibliography</i>	216
	<i>Index</i>	235