

Animal Rights Law

Raffael N Fasel
and
Sean C Butler

• H A R T •

OXFORD • LONDON • NEW YORK • NEW DELHI • SYDNEY

HART PUBLISHING

Bloomsbury Publishing Plc

Kemp House, Chawley Park, Cumnor Hill, Oxford, OX2 9PH, UK

1385 Broadway, New York, NY 10018, USA

29 Earlsfort Terrace, Dublin 2, Ireland

HART PUBLISHING, the Hart/Stag logo, BLOOMSBURY and the Diana logo are trademarks of Bloomsbury Publishing Plc

First published in Great Britain 2023

Reprinted 2023

Copyright © Raffael N Fasel and Sean C Butler, 2023

Raffael N Fasel and Sean C Butler have asserted their right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 to be identified as Authors of this work.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers.

While every care has been taken to ensure the accuracy of this work, no responsibility for loss or damage occasioned to any person acting or refraining from action as a result of any statement in it can be accepted by the authors, editors or publishers.

All UK Government legislation and other public sector information used in the work is Crown Copyright ©.

All House of Lords and House of Commons information used in the work is Parliamentary Copyright ©.

This information is reused under the terms of the Open Government Licence v3.0 (<http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/version/3/>) except where otherwise stated.

All Eur-lex material used in the work is © European Union, <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/>, 1998–2023.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Names: Fasel, Raffael N, author. | Butler, Sean C, author.

Title: Animal rights law / Raffael N Fasel and Sean C Butler.

Description: Oxford, UK ; New York, NY : Hart Publishing, an Imprint of Bloomsbury Publishing, 2023. | Includes bibliographical references and index. | Summary: "Do animals have legal rights? This pioneering book tells readers everything they need to know about animal rights law. The book starts with an overview of anti-cruelty and animal welfare laws, before focusing on progress towards granting basic rights and legal personhood to animals. It uses straightforward examples from over 30 legal systems from both the civil and common law traditions, and is based on the Animal Rights Law course which the authors teach at the University of Cambridge. To help readers understand the legal evolution, it explains the ethics, legal theory, and social issues behind animal rights and connected topics such as property, standing, dignity, and human rights. The book's companion website (bloomsbury.pub/animal-rights-law) provides links to key references and journals, as well as briefs on the latest cases in this fast-changing area, and gives readers the tools to investigate their own legal systems with a list of jurisdiction-specific bibliographic references. Rich in exercises and study aids, this easy-to-use introduction is a prime resource for law students as well as anyone else who wants to understand how the law is changing to protect animals." —Provided by publisher.

Identifiers: LCCN 2022046033 | ISBN 9781509956463 (hardback) | ISBN 9781509956104 (paperback) | ISBN 9781509956128 (pdf) | ISBN 9781509956111 (Epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Animals—Law and legislation. | Animal welfare—Law and legislation. | Animal rights.

Classification: LCC K3620 .F37 2023 | DDC 344.04/9—dc23/eng/20221201

LC record available at <https://ccn.loc.gov/2022046033>

ISBN	PB	978-1-50995-610-4
	ePDF	978-1-50995-612-8
	ePub	978-1-50995-611-1

Typeset by Compuscript Ltd, Shannon
Printed and bound in Great Britain by CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon CR0 4YY



To find out more about our authors and books visit www.hartpublishing.co.uk. Here you will find extracts, author information, details of forthcoming events and the option to sign up for our newsletters.

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	vii
<i>Table of Figures</i>	xiii
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xv
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xix
Introduction	1
1. The Current Legal Status of Animals	8
I. Introduction.....	8
II. The Property Status of Animals.....	10
A. Animals as Simple Property.....	10
B. Animals as More than Simple Property.....	12
III. Legislation Protecting Animals.....	14
A. The History of Animal Protection.....	15
B. Anti-Cruelty Laws.....	18
C. Animal Welfare Laws.....	19
D. Species-Specific Provisions.....	22
E. Limits of Animal Protection Laws: Exclusions and Exceptions.....	23
IV. Constitutional Law.....	25
A. Competence Norms.....	26
B. State Objectives.....	26
C. Direct Legal Protections.....	27
V. International Law.....	28
VI. Animal Protection Laws in Practice.....	30
VII. Conclusion.....	31
2. Welfarism vs Abolitionism, a Dichotomy?	34
I. Introduction.....	34
II. Classic Welfarism.....	35
A. Bigger Cages! Classic Welfarism and the Humane Treatment of Animals.....	35
B. Critiques of Classic Welfarism.....	38
III. Abolitionism.....	39
A. No Cages! The Abolitionist Case for Ending Animal Exploitation.....	40
B. Critiques of Abolitionism.....	42
IV. New Welfarism.....	44
A. First Bigger Cages, Then No Cages! New Welfarism's Hybrid Approach.....	44
B. Critiques of New Welfarism.....	46

x CONTENTS

V.	Beyond the Dichotomy.....	48
A.	Cooperation Instead of Abolition: Sue Donaldson and Will Kymlicka's Theory of Shared Multispecies Communities.....	48
B.	Dialogue over Debate: Melanie Joy's Plea for a Multi-Pronged Strategy.....	50
VI.	Conclusion.....	52
3.	Philosophical Foundations of Animal Rights.....	54
I.	Introduction.....	54
II.	Peter Singer's Utilitarianism.....	55
A.	Extending the Scope of Moral Concern to Animals.....	56
B.	How Animals' Interests Ought to be Considered.....	57
III.	Tom Regan's Deontological Approach.....	58
A.	Regan's Critique of Utilitarianism.....	59
B.	Inherent Value and Subjects-of-a-Life.....	60
IV.	Martha Nussbaum's Capabilities Approach.....	62
A.	Nussbaum's Critique of Other Approaches.....	62
B.	The Capabilities Approach.....	63
V.	Sue Donaldson and Will Kymlicka's Political Theory.....	66
A.	The Political Turn in Animal Ethics and Animal Studies.....	66
B.	<i>Zoopolis's</i> Differentiated Theory of Animal Rights.....	67
VI.	Critical Approaches to Animal Rights.....	69
A.	The Ecofeminist Critique.....	69
B.	The Conservationist Critique.....	71
C.	The Contractualist Critique.....	72
VII.	Conclusion.....	74
4.	The Legal Theory of Animal Rights.....	76
I.	Introduction.....	76
II.	Are Animals Fit to have Legal Rights?.....	77
A.	The Choice-Based Approach to Rights.....	77
B.	Evaluating the Choice-Based Approach.....	79
C.	The Interest-Based Approach to Rights.....	79
D.	Evaluating the Interest-Based Approach.....	81
III.	Do Animals Already have Legal Rights?.....	83
A.	Animals Already have Legal Rights: The Thin Conception.....	83
B.	The Thin Conception: A Review.....	86
C.	Animals do not Yet have Legal Rights: The Thick Conception.....	88
IV.	Would Animals Need to Become Legal Persons?.....	92
A.	The Traditional View: Legal Personhood is Necessary for Rights-Holdership.....	93
B.	The Unorthodox View: Legal Personhood is not Necessary for Rights-Holdership.....	95
C.	Evaluating the Traditional and Unorthodox Views.....	97
V.	Conclusion.....	98

5. Animal Rights and Human Rights	101
I. Introduction	101
II. Should Only Humans have Human Rights?	102
A. Are Human Rights Grounded in Human Properties? The Foundationalist Approach	102
B. Are Human Rights the Outcome of Political Practices and Decisions? The Anti-Foundationalist Approach	105
III. Should Animals have Similar Rights to Humans?	107
A. Do Human and Animal Rights Flow from the Same Source?	107
B. Are Human and Animal Rights Mutually Supportive?	109
IV. How Could Human and Animal Rights be Reconciled Legally?	111
A. Rights Conflicts and the Proportionality Test	112
B. Prioritising the Rights of Minorities?	114
C. The Species Membership Approach	115
V. Conclusion	117
6. Animal Rights in Litigation	119
I. Introduction	119
II. Animals and the Issue of Legal Standing to Bring an Action	120
A. Cetacean Community (2003)	121
B. Hiasl (2007)	121
C. Tilikum, Katina, Corky, Kasatka, and Ulises (2012)	122
D. Naruto (2016)	123
III. Animals as Subjects of <i>Habeas Corpus</i>	124
A. Tommy and Kiko (2013)	125
B. Hercules and Leo (2013)	126
C. Cecilia (2016)	127
D. Chucho (2017)	129
E. Beulah, Karen, and Minnie (2017)	131
F. Happy (2018)	132
IV. Fundamental Rights and Personhood Litigation Beyond <i>Habeas Corpus</i>	135
A. Animal Welfare Board of India v Nagaraja (2014)	136
B. Kaavan (2020)	137
C. The Swiss Primate Rights Case (2019)	138
D. Estrellita (2022)	138
E. People for Animals v Md Mohazzim (2015)	141
F. Stray Dogs (2021)	142
G. Karnail Singh v State of Haryana (2019)	143
H. Sandra (2014)	143
V. Conclusion	145

xii CONTENTS

7. Animal Rights in Legislation	148
I. Introduction.....	148
II. Domestic Proposals for Animal Rights Laws.....	149
A. The Swiss Primate Rights Initiative.....	149
B. The Finnish Rights Proposal.....	151
C. Evaluating the Proposals.....	153
III. International Proposals for Animal Rights Laws.....	153
A. An International Treaty on Animal Rights?.....	154
B. Universal Declaration of Animal Rights.....	155
C. Declaration of Rights for Cetaceans	156
D. Evaluating the Proposals.....	157
IV. Drafting Animal Rights Laws	159
A. The Mechanics of Law Reform	159
B. Scope.....	161
C. Legal Status.....	162
D. The Procedural Rights of Animals.....	163
E. The Substantive Rights of Animals.....	164
V. Conclusion	166
8. Animal Rights as a Social Justice Movement	169
I. Introduction.....	169
II. The Animal Rights Movement as Abolitionist.....	170
A. Human Abolitionism	170
B. The Origins of Abolitionism in Animal Rights	171
C. The Implications of Abolitionism in Animal Rights	173
III. Animal Rights and Connections with Other Rights Movements.....	174
A. Analogies with Other Movements to Support Animal Rights	174
B. Links with Feminism and Interlocking Oppression.....	177
C. A Failure in the System?.....	178
IV. Learning Lessons	180
A. Direct Action, Consciousness-Raising, the Use of Social Media, and New Directions	180
B. Compromise.....	181
V. Conclusion	182
Conclusion.....	185
<i>Bibliography.....</i>	<i>188</i>
<i>Glossary.....</i>	<i>195</i>
<i>Index.....</i>	<i>203</i>