Contents

1 Introduction 1
   A Rethinking miscarriages of justice and criminal appeals 1
   B A note on our use of theory 5
   C A caveat on finality 8
   D The structure of the book 10

2 Problematizing miscarriage of justice 13
   A Introduction 13
   B A conception of miscarriage of justice 16
   C Truth as a value in criminal justice 18
   D Due process as a value in criminal justice 25
   E The relationship between truth and due process within criminal justice 32
   F Generating miscarriage of justice 35

3 Remedying miscarriages of justice: the history of the Court of Criminal Appeal 39
   A Introduction 39
   B Before the Criminal Appeal Act 1907 41
   C The emergence of the Court of Criminal Appeal 50
   D The great 'experiment': how did it work? 55
   E The reforms of the 1960s 62
   F The Court's decisions after the 1960s reforms 71
   G The reforms of the 1990s 82
   H Understanding reformulated powers 87
   I Conclusion 89

4 Into and out of crisis: a recent history of media reporting on miscarriages of justice 92
   A Misreading conviction, acquittal, and miscarriage 93
   B Constructing crisis 101
   C Analysing media reporting on miscarriages of justice 107
   D Before the recent crisis: 1987–8 111
   E From miscarriage to crisis: 1989–92 117
   F Losing the momentum of crisis: 1993–4 149
   G After the crisis: 1995–6 163
   H Underlying patterns 167
Contents

5 Scientific evidence and investigation by the new Criminal Cases Review Commission: the scope for further miscarriages of justice and crisis
   A Introduction 171
   B Legal authority and scientific authority 173
   C Two case studies: the Birmingham Six appeals (1987/8 and 1991) and the Maguire Seven appeal (1991) 189
   D Legal authority and investigation: the Criminal Cases Review Commission 215

6 From understanding miscarriage of justice to reform 229
   A Tragic Choices analysis of the impetus to reform motivated by high profile miscarriages of justice 230
   B Managing inevitable miscarriage of justice—the role and reform of the Court of Appeal 235
   C Alternative explanations of the role of the Court 245
   D After the last crisis 251
   E A Tragic Choices and autopoietic systems theory analysis of criminal justice reform 255
   F Conclusion 259

Bibliography 263

Index 275

This book has arisen out of attempts to understand miscarriages of justice and of attempts to reform early in the nineteenth century by the pattern of repeated crises by the media. Underwritings and arguments suggest that this tradition, which lead to miscarriages for further crisis and reform, is: why should this?

Two strands of theory have developed: theory and Calabresi and Bordon. The first strand of theory and Calabresi and Bord...