CLASS ACTIONS
AND OTHER MULTI-PARTY LITIGATION
IN A NUTSHELL
Fourth Edition

By
ROBERT H. KLONOFF
Dean and Professor of Law
Lewis & Clark Law School

WEST®
A Thomson Reuters business
OUTLINE

Page

TABLE OF CASES ........................................... XXIX

Chapter 1. Introduction .................................. 9

Chapter 2. Evolution and Overview of Federal Court Class Actions .......... 16
  § 2.1 Equity Rule 48 .................................. 19
  § 2.2 Equity Rule 38 .................................. 19
  § 2.3 The 1938 Version of Rule 23 ..................... 20
  § 2.4 The 1966 Version of Rule 23 ..................... 22
  § 2.5 Overview of Current Rule 23 ..................... 23
  § 2.6 Class Action Fairness Act of 2005 ............... 28
    A. Jurisdictional Provisions ......................... 28
    B. Settlement Provisions ............................ 29

Chapter 3. Class Certification Requirements: Threshold Requirements and Rule 23(a) ........... 30
  § 3.1 A Definable Class ............................. 31
  § 3.2 A Representative Who Is a Member of the Class .................... 34
  § 3.3 A Claim That Is Not Moot ........................ 35
  § 3.4 Numerosity .................................... 38
    A. Overview ........................................ 38
    B. Size of the Potential Class ...................... 39
    C. Possible Future Claimants ...................... 40
## OUTLINE

| D. Other Factors Bearing on Numerosity | 41 |
| E. Applicability to Subclasses        | 42 |
| F. Re-Evaluation of Numerosity        | 43 |
| G. Recent Trends                      | 43 |
| § 3.5 Commonality                     | 44 |
| A. The Watershed Opinion in Dukes     | 44 |
| B. Whether More Than One Common Legal or Factual Issue Is Necessary | 49 |
| C. Law or Fact                        | 49 |
| § 3.6 Typicality                      | 50 |
| A. Lack of Consensus on Meaning       | 50 |
| B. General Approach By Courts Giving Separate Meaning to Typicality | 52 |
| C. Unique Defenses                    | 52 |
| D. Plaintiff Seeking Recovery Against Only One of Several Defendants | 55 |
| E. Factual Disparities Defeating Typicality | 55 |
| § 3.7 Adequacy of Representation      | 56 |
| A. Overview                           | 56 |
| B. Counterintuitive Feature That Challenges to Adequacy Are Normally Raised By Defendants | 58 |
| C. Adjudicating the Adequacy of Class Representatives | 59 |
| D. Vigorous Prosecution               | 60 |
| E. Knowledge of the Case              | 60 |
OUTLINE

Factors Bearing on Nurturance to Subclasses
Equation of Numerosity
Trends

watershed Opinion in

More Than One Com-legal or Factual Issue

act

Consensus on Meaning
Approach By Courts
Separate Meaning to

Defenses
Seeking Recovery
Only One of Several

Disparities Defeating
Adequacy

Intuitive Feature That
Adjudicates Adequacy Are

ally Raised By Defense

Chapter 4. Class Certification Requirements: Rule 23(b)
§ 4.1 Rule 23(b)(1)(A) Classes
A. The Purposes of Rule
23(b)(1)(A) Classes
B. Requirements for Certification
Under Rule 23(b)(1)(A)
C. Certification Under Rule
23(b)(1)(A) in Cases Seeking
Monetary Damages
D. Certification of Medical Monitor-
ing Classes Under Rule
23(b)(1)(A)
OUTLINE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>E.</td>
<td>Other Kinds of Cases Involving Rule 23(b)(1)(A)</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 4.2</td>
<td>Rule 23(b)(1)(B) Classes</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td>Overview of Rule 23(b)(1)(B)</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td><em>Stare Decisis</em> Effect Insufficient to Satisfy Rule 23(b)(1)(B)</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.</td>
<td>Requirements for “Limited Fund” Treatment</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.</td>
<td>Rule 23(b)(1)(B) and Punitive Damages</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E.</td>
<td>Other Types of Rule 23(b)(1)(B) Cases</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F.</td>
<td>Comparisons Between Rule 23(b)(1)(B) and Other Joiner Devices</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G.</td>
<td>Preference Between Mandatory and Opt Out Classes</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H.</td>
<td>Opting Out of a Rule 23(b)(1) Class</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 4.3</td>
<td>Rule 23(b)(2)</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td>Overview</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td>General Requirements</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.</td>
<td>Whether the Party Seeking Certification Must Demonstrate Predominance or Superiority</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.</td>
<td>Requirement That Monetary Relief Be “Incidental” to Declaratory or Injunctive Relief</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
OUTLINE

1. Types of Cases Involving Rule 23(b)(1)(A) Cases

2. Effect Insufficiency to Satisfy Rule 23(b)(1)(B) Requirements for "Limited Treatment"

3. Types of Rule 23(b)(1)(B) and Punitive Damages Between Rule 23(b)(1)(B) and Other Joinder Classes

4. The Between Mandato-opt Out Classes

5. Suit out of a Rule 23(b)(1) Requirement that Monetary Be "Incidental" to Theory or Injunctive

§ 4.4 Rule 23(b)(3)

A. Overview

B. Defining "Predominance"

C. Calculation of Individual Damages and the Predominance Inquiry

D. Submission of a Trial Plan

E. Special Issues Regarding Fraud and Reliance

F. Securities Cases: Special Situations in Which a Court May Presume Reliance

G. Predominance and Mass Torts

H. Rule 23(b)(3) Predominance and Choice-Of-Law Concerns in Multi-Jurisdictional Class Actions

I. Superiority in Rule 23(b)(3) Classes: Alternative Methods for Resolving the Dispute

Page

82
83
83
84
85
89
93
94
95
96
96
97
99
104
107
108
108
110
111
112
112
113
117
117
118
121
123
123
124

XI
J. Assessing Superiority in Rule 23(b)(3) Classes Using Enumerated Factors

(1) Rule 23(b)(3)(A): Interest in Individual Control of the Litigation 126
(2) Rule 23(b)(3)(B): Extent and Nature of Pending Litigation 128
(3) Rule 23(b)(3)(C): Desirability or Undesirability of Concentrating the Litigation in the Particular Forum 130
(4) Rule 23(b)(3)(D): Manageability Issues 130

K. Assessing Superiority Under Rule 23(b)(3) Using Factors Other Than Those Enumerated 132

Chapter 5. Litigating a Class Action

§ 5.1 Strategic Considerations in Class Action Litigation

A. Plaintiff's Perspective 135
B. Defendant's Perspective 142

§ 5.2 Discovery in Class Actions

A. Class Certification Discovery

(1) Overview 145
(2) Granting or Denying Class Certification Without Discovery 146
(3) Conditional Certification or Deferral of Certification Pending Discovery 148
(4) Discovery of Merits Issues Before Class Certification 149
(5) Types of Pre-Certification Discovery ........................................ 152
(6) Limitations on the Scope of Class Certification Discovery .......... 153
(7) Discovery of Names of Absent Class Members ....................... 156
(8) Pre-Certification Discovery Directed at Absent Class Members .... 158
(9) Expert Discovery and Judicial Gatekeeping ................................ 159
B. Post-Certification Merits Discovery in Class Actions ................. 160
(1) General Principles .............................................................. 160
(2) Discovery of the Unnamed Class Members' Individual Claims ..... 161
(3) Penalties for Noncompliance With Discovery Requests ............ 162
(4) Stay of Discovery Pending Dispositive Motions ....................... 162
§ 5.3 The Class Certification Decision .......................................... 163
A. Overview ............................................................................. 163
B. Timing of Certification Decision ........................................... 163
C. Raising the Certification Issue .............................................. 165
D. Court's Obligation to Rule ................................................... 166
E. Appropriateness of Inquiry into the Merits .............................. 167
F. The Certification Hearing .................................................... 173
(1) Need for a Hearing on Class Certification ............................ 173
(2) Burden of Proof and Procedures at the Hearing .................... 173

XIII
## OUTLINE

(3) Expert Testimony at the Class Certification Stage ........................................ 174
(4) Reasons for the Certification Ruling ................................................................. 174

G. Certification Options .................................................. 175
(1) Conditional Certification .................................................. 175
(2) Use of Subclasses .......................................................... 176
(3) Issue Certification and Bifurcation .................................................. 178
(4) Multiple or Competing Classes .................................................. 180
(5) Decertification ............................................................... 181

§ 5.4 Orders Controlling Class Proceedings ........................................................ 182
  A. Rule 23(d)(1)(A) .......................................................... 182
  B. Rule 23(d)(1)(B) .......................................................... 183
  C. Rule 23(d)(1)(C) .......................................................... 184
  D. Rule 23(d)(1)(D) .......................................................... 185
  E. Rule 23(d)(1)(E) .......................................................... 185

§ 5.5 Miscellaneous Trial Issues .................................................. 186
§ 5.6 Alternative Dispute Resolution .................................................. 187

Chapter 6. Notice, Opt-Out Rights, and Communications With Class Members

§ 6.1 Class Notice and Opt-Out Rights .................................................. 192
  A. Notice and Opt-Out Rights in Rule 23(b)(3) Class Actions ....................... 193
  B. Methods for Providing Notice in Rule 23(b)(3) Class Actions ..................... 195
  C. Timing of Rule 23(c)(2) Notice .................................................. 196
  D. Form and Content of Rule 23(c)(2) Notice ............................................. 197
E. The Cost of Providing Notice in Rule 23(b)(3) Class Actions ........................................ 198
F. Ability to Opt Out of a Rule 23(b)(3) Class .......................................................... 201
G. Notice in 23(b)(1) and 23(b)(2) Class Actions .................................................. 202
H. Opt-Out Rights in Rule 23(b)(1) and Rule 23(b)(2) Classes ......................... 204
I. Other Notices Pursuant to Rule 23(d)(1) ............................................................ 206
J. Notice to Absent Class Members of a Proposed Settlement, Dismissal, or Compromise Under Rule 23(e) ...... 207
K. Notice of Decertification ................................................................. 209

§ 6.2 Communications With Class Members .................................................. 210
A. Contacts With Potential Class Members Before Class Action Is Filed .................. 210
B. Communications With Potential Class Members Between Filing and Class Certification ......................................... 210
   (1) Reasons for Contacting Class Members .................................................. 210
   (2) Use of Rule 23(d) to Regulate Communications With Class Members .......... 211
   (3) The Gulf Oil Decision ................................................................. 212
   (4) Developments After Gulf Oil ......................................................... 213
Chapter 7. Multi-Jurisdictional and State Court Class Actions

§ 7.1 Nationwide and Other Multi-Jurisdictional Class Actions
   A. Standards for Certifying a Multi-Jurisdictional Class
   B. Procedural and Manageability Issues

§ 7.2 State Court Class Actions
   A. Importance of State Court Class Actions
   B. Overview of State Class Action Rules

Chapter 8. Constitutional and Procedural Issues

§ 8.1 Statute of Limitations Issues in Class Actions
**OUTLINE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Overview of “Tolling” Principles in Class Actions</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. When Tolling Ceases</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Limitations on the <em>American Pipe</em> Tolling Rule</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Application of <em>American Pipe</em> to Opt Outs</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Amending Individual Actions to Assert Class Claims</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

§ 8.2 Jurisdictional Issues: General Concepts | 239

A. Determining Citizenship for Diversity Purposes | 240
B. Aggregation of Claims for Purposes of Jurisdictional Amount | 243

§ 8.3 The Class Action Fairness Act | 248

A. Overview | 248
B. Expanded Federal Jurisdiction Over Class Actions | 248
C. Establishing “Minimal” Diversity | 250
D. Aggregating Claims | 251
E. Mass Actions | 252
F. Expanded Removal to Federal Court | 253
G. Exceptions to CAFA’s Jurisdictional Rules | 254
H. Appellate Review | 259

§ 8.4 Claim Preclusion (Res Judicata) in the Class Action Context | 261

A. Overview | 261

XVII
OUTLINE

B. Class Members Who May Not Be Bound by a Prior Adjudication .................. 262

§ 8.5 Issue Preclusion (Collateral Estoppel) in the Class Action Context ........ 264

§ 8.6 Federal Control Over State Courts ....... 266
   A. Binding Effect of State Court Settlements of Exclusively Federal Claims ...... 266
   B. Collateral Attacks Based on Adequacy of Representation 268
   C. Binding Effect of Prior Federal Court Denial of Class Certification Upon a Later State Court Class Action ........... 270

§ 8.7 Clashes Between Federal Rule 23 and State Law .................................. 271

§ 8.8 Seventh Amendment ...................... 275
   A. Overview .................................. 275
   B. Bifurcated Trials and the Re-examination Clause .................. 276
   C. Criticism of the Rhone-Poulenc and Castano Approach 279
   D. Other Seventh Amendment Issues .................................. 280

§ 8.9 Due Process Issues .......................... 281

Chapter 9. Class Action Settlements, Remedies, and Attorneys’ Fees .......... 283

§ 9.1 Class Action Settlements ...................... 283
   A. Overview: Interested Participants .................................. 284
OUTLINE

B. Methods for Setting the Amount of Fees 310

Chapter 10. Appellate Review 315
§ 10.1 Whether an Order Denying Class Certification Is a Final Decision Under 28 U.S.C. § 1291 317
§ 10.2 Appeal From a Denial of Class Certification When a Class Representative Fails to Prosecute His or Her Individual Claims 318
§ 10.3 Appeal of Denial of Certification Under 28 U.S.C. § 1292(a)(1) 319
§ 10.4 Appeal of Class Certification Ruling Under 28 U.S.C. § 1292(b) 319
§ 10.5 Mandamus Review of Certification Ruling 320
§ 10.6 Appeal Under Rule 23(f) 322
§ 10.7 Intervention for Purposes of Appeal 327
§ 10.8 Standard of Review 328

Chapter 11. Special Focus on Mass Tort, Employment Discrimination, and Securities Fraud Class Actions 330
§ 11.1 Mass Torts 330
A. Judicial Trends in Mass Torts Class Actions 332
   (1) Mass Torts in the 1960s and 1970s 332
   (2) Mass Torts in the Mid-1980s 333
   (3) Recent Judicial Skepticism 335
   (4) Responses to Judicial Skepticism 338
B. Other Issues in Mass Tort Cases 339
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OUTLINE</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(1) Exposure–Only Claimants</td>
<td>339</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) “Mature” Versus “Immature” Mass Torts</td>
<td>340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3) Problems of Classwide Proof in Mass Tort Cases</td>
<td>341</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 11.2 Employment Discrimination Class Actions</td>
<td>345</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Rule 23 Cases</td>
<td>346</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1) Applicability of Rule 23 Requirements in Discrimination Cases</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) Distinction Between Disparate Impact and Disparate Treatment Claims</td>
<td>348</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3) Rule 23(b) Requirements</td>
<td>349</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(4) Pattern-and-Practice Cases</td>
<td>350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(5) Whether a Finding of No Pattern or Practice Precludes Subsequent Individual Actions</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(6) Seventh Amendment Issues</td>
<td>352</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Collective Actions</td>
<td>352</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1) Overview of Age Discrimination Suits</td>
<td>352</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) Notice to Plaintiffs in ADEA Cases</td>
<td>354</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3) Certification of an ADEA Case as a Collective Action</td>
<td>355</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 11.3 Securities Fraud Class Actions</td>
<td>356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Overview</td>
<td>356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Elements of a Rule 10b–5 Claim</td>
<td>358</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1) The Reliance Element</td>
<td>358</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) Fraud-on-the-Market Approach to Reliance</td>
<td>359</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 12. Defendant Class Actions, Derivative Suits, and Suits Involving Unincorporated Associations

§ 12.1 Defendant Class Actions

A. Overview
B. Rule 23 Criteria and Defendant Classes

(1) Overview
(2) Typicality
(3) Adequacy of Representation
(4) Rule 23(b)(1)(A) Classes
(5) Rule 23(b)(1)(B) Classes
(6) Rule 23(b)(2) Classes
(7) Rule 23(b)(3) Classes
C. Other Issues

(1) Statutes of Limitation
(2) Notice
(3) Personal Jurisdiction

§ 12.2 Shareholder Derivative Suits
OUTLINE

A. Overview ........................................ 384
B. Requirements of Rule 23.1 ........ 385
   (1) Derivative Injury Requirement ...... 386
   (2) Plaintiff Must Be a Shareholder at
       the Time of the Alleged Wrong-
       doing ........................................ 386
   (3) Demand for Corporate Action ...... 387
   (4) Derivative Actions May Not Be
       Collusive ................................... 388
   (5) Plaintiff Must Fairly and Ade-
       quately Represent the Interests
       of Other Shareholders Similarly
       Situated ...................................... 388
   (6) Notice of a Proposed Settlement to
       Shareholders ............................... 388
   (7) Court Approval of Settlement or
       Dismissal ................................... 389
§ 12.3 Class Actions Involving Unincorporated
   Associations .................................. 389
   A. Overview ................................... 389
   B. Enactment of Federal Rule 23.2 .... 391
      (1) Diversity Jurisdiction Issues ...... 391
      (2) Limitation on Qualifying Organiza-
           tions ..................................... 393
      (3) Incorporation of Rule 23 Require-
           ments into Rule 23.2 ................. 394
Chapter 13. Ethical and Policy Issues in
   Class Actions .................................. 395
§ 13.1 Ethical Issues in Class Actions .......... 395
   A. Overview ................................... 395

XXIII
OUTLINE

B. Attorney Communications With Class Members ............ 396
   (1) Pre-Certification Communications 396
   (2) Post-Certification Communications 397

C. Conflicts of Interest ......................... 398
   (1) Collusion Between Plaintiffs’ Counsel and Defense Counsel in Settlements 398
   (2) Conflicts Among Class Members ... 399
   (3) Conflicts Between Class Counsel and the Class Members .......... 400
   (4) Percentage-of-the-Fund Fee Awards ................................ 401

D. Other Ethical Issues ......................... 402
   (1) Advancing Costs of Litigation ............... 402
   (2) Restrictions on Right to Practice ... 402
   (3) Failure to Communicate With Class Members .................. 403

§ 13.2 Policy and Reform Issues .................. 403
   A. Reform Proposals .............................. 403
      (1) Aggregate Litigation Project .......... 404
      (2) Proposals Considered by the Advisory Committee on Civil Rules 405


§ 14.1 Permissive Joinder of Parties .......... 409
   A. Overview .................................... 409
   B. Joinder of Plaintiffs ....................... 410
      (1) Same Transaction or Occurrence ... 411
      (2) Common Question of Law or Fact 412

XXIV
(3) Interest in Obtaining All Relief

C. Joinder of Defendants

D. Orders to Avoid Prejudice

E. Misjoinder of Parties

F. Jurisdictional Issues

§ 14.2 Compulsory Joinder of Parties

A. Overview

B. Determination of Whether the Absent Party Is Necessary

(1) Rule 19(a)(1) ("Complete Relief" Clause)

(2) Rule 19(a)(1)(B)(i) ("Impair or Impede" Clause)

(3) Rule 19(a)(1)(B)(ii) ("Multiple Liability" Clause)

C. Feasibility of Joinder

D. Resolution When Person Should Be Joined but Joiner Is Not Feasible

E. Procedural Issues

§ 14.3 Impleader

A. Overview

B. Circumstances in Which Impleader Is Allowed

C. When Leave of Court Is Required for Impleader

D. Assertion of Defenses

E. Pleading Requirements

F. Other Third-Party Practice

G. Moving to Strike Third-Party Claims
OUTLINE

H. Jurisdictional Requirements... 432

§ 14.4 Interpleader................................. 434
  A. Overview................................. 434
  B. Rule Interpleader......................... 435
     (1) Stakeholder’s Concern Over Multi-
         ple Claims........................... 435
     (2) At Least Two Adverse Claimants... 436
     (3) Jurisdiction, Venue, and Other
         Procedural Requirements for
         Rule Interpleader..................... 436
     (4) Two Stages of an Interpleader ...... 437
  C. Statutory Interpleader................. 437
     (1) Overview.............................. 437
     (2) Jurisdictional and Other Procedur-
         al Requirements for Statutory
         Interpleader........................ 437

§ 14.5 Intervention............................... 439
  A. Overview................................ 439
  B. General Requirements for In-
      tervention as of Right................. 439
     (1) Timeliness of a Motion to Intervene..... 441
     (2) The Applicant’s Interest in the
         Subject Matter...................... 441
     (3) Practical Impairment............... 443
     (4) Inadequacy of Existing Representa-
         tion................................ 443
     (5) Standing.............................. 444
  C. Permissive Intervention............... 444
  D. Procedures for Intervention.......... 447
  E. Jurisdictional Issues................... 447
  F. Amicus Participation.................. 448
OUTLINE

§ 14.6 Consolidation ........................................ 448
A. Overview .............................................. 448
B. Nature and Purposes of Consolidation ............... 449
C. Considerations in Evaluating Whether to Consolidate ... 450
D. Separate Trials ....................................... 451

Chapter 15. Other Aggregation and Coordination Devices in Federal Practice ............................... 453
§ 15.1 Multidistrict Litigation ................................ 454
A. Overview .............................................. 454
B. Initiation of Proceedings Under Section 1407 ......... 455
C. Standards for Transfer ................................... 455
D. Selection of the Transferee Court ....................... 456
E. Effect of a Transfer Order ............................... 456
F. Transferee Court’s Trial of a Case ....................... 457
G. Review of MDL Panel Rulings ............................. 458

§ 15.2 Transfers Under 28 U.S.C. § 1404 .................. 458
A. Overview .............................................. 458
B. Requirements for Transfer ............................... 459
C. For the Convenience of the Parties and Witnesses .... 460
D. Interest of Justice ..................................... 460
E. Use of Section 1404(A) as an Aggregation Device ...... 460

§ 15.3 Multiparty, Multiforum Trial Jurisdiction Act of 2002 .................................................. 461

§ 15.4 Coordination Among Federal Courts .......... 462
§ 15.5 Bankruptcy as an Aggregation Device 463
§ 15.6 Federal/State Coordination 468
  A. Overview 468
  B. Reform Efforts Addressing Coordination of Federal and State Claims 469
§ 15.7 Aggregate Settlement of Non-Class Cases 471

INDEX 473