Law, Policy and Reproductive Autonomy

Erin Nelson
Summary Contents

Preface iii
Acknowledgements vii
Contents ix
Table of Cases xiii
Table of Legislation xvii
Table of Convention, Treaties, etc xxvii

1 Introduction 1

PART ONE REPRODUCTIVE AUTONOMY IN THEORY AND PRACTICE 9
2 Reproductive Autonomy in Theory 11
3 Theory to Practice: Respecting Reproductive Autonomy 55

PART TWO AVOIDING REPRODUCTION 75
4 Law, Policy and Contraception 77
5 Abortion 112

PART THREE CONTROLLING REPRODUCTIVE OUTCOMES 159
6 Law, Medicine and Pregnancy: Maternal Liability and Intervention in the Lives of Pregnant Women 161
7 Law, Medicine and Pregnancy: Provider Liability for Pre-natal Torts 205

PART FOUR ASSISTING REPRODUCTION 235
8 Regulating Assisted Reproductive Technologies: Governance and Access to Treatment 237
9 Assisted Reproduction: Reproductive Materials and Reproductive Services, and Parentage after ART Treatment 290
10 Conclusion 353

Bibliography 357
Index 397
## Contents

**Preface** vii  
**Acknowledgements** ix  
**Summary of Contents** xi  
**Table of Cases** xvii  
**Table of Legislation** xxvii  
**Table of Convention, Treaties, etc** xli

1 Introduction 1  
   I. Reproductive Autonomy in Law 2  
   II. The Structure of the Book 6

**PART ONE REPRODUCTIVE AUTONOMY IN THEORY AND PRACTICE** 9  
2 Reproductive Autonomy in Theory 11  
   I. What is Autonomy? 12  
      A. The autonomous person 13  
      B. Conditions for autonomy 13  
      C. Autonomy and liberalism 15  
      D. Autonomy in bioethics 16  
   II. Feminist Critique of Autonomy 21  
      A. From feminist critique to feminist articulation: relational autonomy 23  
      B. Tensions in relational autonomy 26  
         i. Relational autonomy and the self 26  
         ii. Relational autonomy and perfectionism 27  
         iii. Some reservations about relational autonomy; and a middle ground? 29  
   III. From Autonomy to Reproductive Autonomy 31  
      A. Feminist critique of reproductive autonomy 37  
      B. Relational autonomy and reproductive decision making 43  
   IV. Reproductive Autonomy: A Way Forward 47  
      A. Reproductive autonomy and reproductive health 51

3 Theory to Practice: Respecting Reproductive Autonomy 55  
   I. Regulation and Respect for Reproductive Autonomy 56  
      A. The context of reproductive autonomy: women’s reproductive lives 56  
      B. The foundation: women’s bodily integrity 62  
   II. A Right to Reproductive Autonomy? 70

**PART TWO AVOIDING REPRODUCTION** 75  
4 Law, Policy and Contraception 77  
   I. Introduction 77
Contents

II. Policy and Access to Contraception
   A. Regulatory barriers to access
   B. Financial barriers to access
   C. Providers as barriers to access: conscientious objection
   D. Emergency contraception and barriers to access
   E. Access to contraception and reproductive autonomy

III. Non-consensual Birth Control
   A. Law and non-consensual birth control
   B. Non-consensual birth control and reproductive autonomy

5 Abortion
   I. Abortion and the Status of the Fetus
   II. Abortion in the Law
      A. Canada
      B. United States
         i. Contemporary trends in US abortion law
      C. Australia
      D. United Kingdom
   III. Law, Abortion and Reproductive Autonomy
   IV. Access to Abortion Services
      A. Abortion funding
      B. Medical abortion
      C. Provider conscientious objection
   V. Special Considerations: Second-Trimester Abortion and Selective Abortion
      A. Second-trimester abortion
      B. Selective abortion

PART THREE CONTROLLING REPRODUCTIVE OUTCOMES

   I. Medicalisation and Pregnancy
      A. Pre-natal care and reproductive autonomy
      B. Medicalisation and the ‘maternal–fetal conflict’
      C. Law and the maternal–fetal conflict
   II. Tort Law: Maternal Liability for Pre-natal Conduct
      A. Common law
      B. Statutory jurisdictions
      C. Tort liability and reproductive autonomy
   III. Intervention in the Lives of Pregnant Women
      A. Compelling medical intervention in pregnancy
         i. Compelled medical intervention and reproductive autonomy
         ii. Caesarean delivery on maternal request
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7 B.</td>
<td>Coercion by the State: controlling the pregnant woman</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>i. Child welfare law</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ii. Criminal law</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>iii. Reproductive autonomy and State intervention</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 C.</td>
<td>Law, Medicine and Pregnancy: Provider Liability for Pre-natal Torts</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>II. Wrongful Life</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A. Wrongful life and reproductive autonomy</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>III. Wrongful Conception</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IV. Wrongful Birth</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>V. Wrongful Conception, Wrongful Birth and Reproductive Autonomy</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>PART FOUR ASSISTING REPRODUCTION</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 A.</td>
<td>Regulating Assisted Reproductive Technologies: Governance and Access to Treatment</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>II. Infertility and Techniques Used in Assisting Conception</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>III. Governance of ARTs: Regulatory Structures</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A. United States</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B. Australia</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C. United Kingdom</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D. Canada</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IV. Regulating ARTs and Reproductive Autonomy</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A. Public or professional regulation?</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B. Independent regulator or government regulation?</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C. ART regulation and reproductive tourism</td>
<td>271</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>V. Controlling Access to Treatment: Eligibility Criteria and Funding</td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A. Access to treatment and eligibility criteria</td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>i. Eligibility criteria and reproductive autonomy</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B. Treatment costs, funding and access to ART treatment</td>
<td>279</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>i. Should we fund ART treatment?</td>
<td>285</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Assisted Reproduction: Reproductive Materials and Reproductive Services and Parentage after ART Treatment</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 A.</td>
<td>Donated Gametes in Assisted Reproduction</td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A. Legal status of gametes</td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B. Consent to use</td>
<td>295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C. Trade in gametes: payment and egg sharing</td>
<td>298</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D. Gamete donor anonymity</td>
<td>303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 B.</td>
<td>Embryos and Assisted Reproduction</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A. Status of the embryo</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>i. Moral status of the embryo</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ii. Legal status of the embryo</td>
<td>310</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

B. Consent to use
C. Embryo testing and selection
   i. Regulating PGD
   ii. PGD and 'saviour siblings'
   iii. PGD and sex selection
   iv. PGD and reproductive autonomy
III. Regulating Surrogacy
   A. Surrogacy law
   B. Surrogacy, regulation and reproductive autonomy
IV. Parentage in Assisted Reproduction
   A. Parentage laws
   B. Parentage, law and reproductive autonomy
V. Reproductive Tourism, Surrogacy and Reproductive Autonomy

Conclusion

Bibliography

Index