

Constructing Intellectual Property

Alexandra George

University of New South Wales



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town,
Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York NY 10013-2473, USA

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107691773

© Alexandra George 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

First paperback edition 2013

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication Data

George, Alexandra.

Constructing intellectual property / Alexandra George.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-01461-9 (hardback)

1. Intellectual property – Philosophy. I. Title.

K1401.G46 2012

346.04'8–dc23 2011030302

ISBN 978-1-107-01461-9 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-107-69177-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in
this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is,
or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> xvi
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xix
<i>List of Authorities</i>	xxi
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xxvii
1. Introduction	1
1.1. An Intellectual Property Fairy Tale	2
1.2. Drawing Analogies and Questioning Assumptions	7
1.2.1. Assumptions About the Existence of Intellectual Property	8
1.2.2. Assumptions About the Authority of ‘Intellectual Property’	9
1.2.3. Compliance with Assumptions and Social Norms	11
1.3. Exploring the Nature of Intellectual Property	15
1.4. Structure of This Book	15
1.4.1. Overview of the Argument	15
1.4.2. Introduction	17
1.4.3. What Is ‘Intellectual Property’? (Chapter 2)	17
1.4.4. The Metaphysics of Intellectual Property (Chapter 3)	18
1.4.5. Intellectual Property’s Core Criteria (Chapter 4)	18

1.4.6.	'Family Resemblance' and Intellectual Property (Chapter 5)	20
1.4.7.	Concluding Remarks (Chapter 6)	22
1.5.	Scope of Analysis in This Book	22
1.5.1.	Locating This Research	23
1.5.2.	Intellectual Property Doctrines and Examples Considered	24
1.5.3.	Jurisdictional Focus	26
1.5.4.	Audience	27
1.6.	Investigating the Fairy Tale	28
2.	The Difficulty of Defining 'Intellectual Property'	31
2.1.	The Importance of Defining 'Intellectual Property'	32
2.1.1.	The Symbolic Strength of 'Intellectual Property'	36
2.1.1.a	A Case for Abandoning 'Intellectual Property'?	37
2.1.1.b	Confronting the Charisma of 'Intellectual Property'	40
2.1.1.c	The Realpolitik of Intellectual Property	43
2.1.2.	The Growth of the Idea of 'Intellectual Property'	47
2.1.3.	Conclusion	50
2.2.	Common Methods of Defining 'Intellectual Property'	51
2.2.1.	Definition by Enumeration	52
2.2.1.a	Intellectual Property as the Enumerated Sum of Its Legal Doctrines	53
2.2.1.b	Intellectual Property as the Enumerated Sum of Its Objects of Regulation	56
2.2.2.	Defining Intellectual Property as a Type of 'Property'	62

CONTENTS	xi
2.2.3. Stipulative Definition	67
2.2.4. Intuitive Definition and Intangibility	70
2.3. The Inadequacy of Common Definitional Methods	76
3. The Metaphysics of Intellectual Property	81
3.1. From Description to Constitution	82
3.2. Law as a Social Construct	85
3.3. Intellectual Property as an Institutional Fact	90
3.3.1. The Nature of Intellectual Property ‘Law’	91
3.3.2. The Nature of Intellectual Property’s Physical Object: The ‘Documented Form’	93
3.3.3. The Nature of Intellectual Property’s ‘Ideational Object’	93
3.3.4. The Nature of the ‘Intellectual Property Object’	95
3.3.5. The Intellectual Property Object as an Institutional Fact	98
3.4. Intellectual Property’s Institutional Facts in Practice	101
3.4.1. A Copyright Example	102
3.4.2. A Trademark Example	107
3.4.3. Conclusion	110
3.5. Constructing Intellectual Property’s Institutional Facts	111
3.5.1. Intellectual Property as a Legal Fiction?	115
3.5.2. The Role of Performative Utterance (‘Speech Acts’)	123
3.5.3. Who Determines the Boundaries of Intellectual Property Objects?	125
3.5.4. The Predictability Created by Intellectual Property Law	130
3.6. Conclusion	134
4. Intellectual Property’s Core Criteria	137
4.1. Intellectual Property’s Conceptual Building Blocks	138

4.1.1.	Core Criteria?	141
4.1.1.a	Conceptual Criteria	144
4.1.1.b	Rights	145
4.1.1.c	Conclusion	147
4.2.	Constructing the Intellectual Property Object	147
4.2.1.	Propertization of an Ideational Object Using the Core Conceptual Criteria	151
4.2.2.	Ideational Object	152
4.2.3.	Documented Form	158
4.2.4.	Creatorship	161
4.2.4.a	The 'Romantic Author'	164
4.2.4.b	Literary Critiques of the Authorship Concept	167
4.2.4.c	Critiques of Intellectual Property Law Creatorship	170
4.2.4.d	Collaborative and Collective Creatorship	174
4.2.4.e	Brands: A Case Study	178
4.2.4.f	Indigenous 'Intellectual Property': A Case Study	191
4.2.4.g	Scientific Authorship: A Case Study	196
4.2.4.h	Conclusion	207
4.2.5.	Originality	210
4.2.5.a	Similar Doctrinal Approaches to Originality	211
4.2.5.b	Originality and the Public Domain	214
4.2.5.c	Is Anything Original?	217
4.2.5.d	Originality and Influences in the Art of Pablo Picasso: A Case Study	222
4.2.6.	The Artificiality and Factuality of Intellectual Concepts in Practice	234
4.2.6.a	Conclusion	236

4.3. Intellectual Property Rights	238
4.3.1. Typical Intellectual Property Rights	238
4.3.2. Property Theory and Intellectual Property Rights	241
4.4. The Operation of Intellectual Property's 'Objects' and 'Rights'	244
4.4.1. The Intellectual Propertization Process: A Copyright Example	246
4.4.1.a Subsistence (Creating Copyright's Intellectual Property Objects)	246
4.4.1.b Rights	248
4.4.1.c The Elasticity of Intellectual Property Doctrines	250
5. 'Family Resemblance' and Intellectual Property	255
5.1. Intellectual Property's Extended Family?	256
5.1.1. Testing the Core Criteria: Subjects of Analysis	258
5.1.2. Methodology	260
5.2. Indigenous Customary Lore	262
5.2.1. Common Themes in Indigenous 'Intellectual Property' Lore	264
5.2.2. Australian Aboriginal 'Intellectual Property' Lore: A Case Study	266
5.2.2.a The Dreaming as Intellectual Property Lore	267
5.2.2.b 'Infringement' of the Dreaming	272
5.2.2.c The Dreaming and Intellectual Property Law	273
5.2.3. Conclusion	277
5.2.4. The International Intellectual Propertization of Customary Lore	279
5.3. Heraldry	281
5.4. Branding of Animals	291

5.5. Workers' Marks	294
5.5.1. Guild Marks	297
5.5.1.a Guild Marks as Intellectual Property (Collective Trademarks)	300
5.5.2. Hallmarks	301
5.5.2.a Traditional Hallmarking	302
5.5.2.b Modern Hallmarking	303
5.5.3. Standards	309
5.5.3.a Standards as Intellectual Property (Certification Trademarks)	312
5.5.4. Conclusion	315
5.6. Refining the Definition of 'Intellectual Property'	317
5.6.1. Definition in Context	319
6. Concluding Remarks	329
6.1. This Study	329
6.2. Brief Recap of the Argument	330
6.3. Themes	331
6.3.1. The Symbolic but Unsettled Nature of 'Intellectual Property'	331
6.3.2. Definitions of Intellectual Property	333
6.3.3. The Constructed and Self-Referential Nature of Intellectual Property	333
6.3.4. Refining the Theory: Intellectual Property in Context	334
6.4. Contribution to the Literature	335
6.5. Directions for Future Research	336
6.6. Likely Implications of This Research for Intellectual Property Law	338
Appendix Normative Approaches to Intellectual Propertization	341
A1 Rights-Based Justifications	341
A1a Labour Theory ('Lockean Theory')	341

CONTENTS**xv**

A1b Desert Theory	343
A1c Personality Theory	343
A2 Economic Justifications	345
A2a To Counter Free-Riding / Incentive to Create	345
A2b To Counter Information Asymmetry	346
A3 Consequentialist Justifications	346
A3a Utilitarian Theory	347
A3b Instrumentalist Theory	347
A3c Social Planning Theory	348
<i>Bibliography</i>	351
<i>Filmography</i>	389
<i>Index</i>	391