

Deontic Logic and Legal Systems

PABLO E. NAVARRO

Blaise Pascal University, Argentina
National University of the South, Argentina

JORGE L. RODRÍGUEZ

National University of Mar del Plata, Argentina

With a Prologue by
Eugenio Bulygin



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

... things are never odd in logic, only different.

P. T. Geach

... there is a good deal of unfinished business for analytical jurisprudence still to tackle, and this unfinished business includes a still much needed clarification of the meaning of the common assertion that laws belong to or constitute a system of laws...

H. L. A. Hart

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521139908

© Pablo E. Navarro and Jorge L. Rodríguez 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Navarro, Pablo E., 1963–

Deontic logic and legal systems / Pablo E. Navarro, Jorge L. Rodríguez.

pages cm – (Cambridge introductions to philosophy and law)

ISBN 978-0-521-76739-2 (hardback) – ISBN 978-0-521-13990-8 (paperback)

1. Law – Methodology. 2. Deontic logic. 3. Law – Philosophy. 4. Semantics (Philosophy)

I. Rodríguez, Jorge L., 1964– II. Title.

K213.N38 2014

340'.1511314 – dc23 2014011555

ISBN 978-0-521-76739-2 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-13990-8 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>Prologue by Eugenio Bulygin</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>Preface</i>	xix

PART I INTRODUCTION TO DEONTIC LOGIC

1	The Language of Logic and the Possibility of Deontic Logic	3
	1.1 Validity, Truth, and Logical Form	3
	1.2 The Language of Logic	8
	1.3 Modal Logic and Deontic Logic	18
	1.4 Main Systems of Deontic Logic	24
	1.5 The Possibility of Deontic Logic	34
2	Paradoxes and Shortcomings of Deontic Logic	39
	2.1 Paradoxes of Deontic Logic	39
	2.2 More Serious Challenges	44
	2.3 Facing Jørgensen's Dilemma	50
	2.4 Deontic Logic with or without Truth	61
	2.5 Conceptions of Norms: Two Alternatives for Deontic Logic	66
3	Norm-propositions, Conditional Norms, and Defeasibility	78
	3.1 Logic of Norms and Logic of Norm-propositions	78
	3.2 An Apparent Dilemma for a Logic of Norm-propositions	85
	3.3 Conditional Norms	91
	3.4 Factual and Deontic Detachment	97
	3.5 Defeasibility and Deontic Logic	105

PART II LOGIC AND LEGAL SYSTEMS

4	Legal Systems and Legal Validity	117
4.1	Normative Systems and the Existence of Norms	117
4.2	Scope and Force of Legal Norms	125
4.3	Applicability and Validity	132
4.4	Applicable Systems and Hierarchical Orderings	136
4.5	Two Concepts of Legal Systems	143
5	Legal Indeterminacy: Normative Gaps and Conflicts of Norms	150
5.1	Formal Properties of Applicable Systems	150
5.2	The Problem of Legal Gaps	158
5.3	Normative Relevance and Axiological Gaps	166
5.4	Legal Conflicts and Coherence	175
5.5	Relevance, Conflicts, and Defeasibility of Legal Norms	185
6	Legal Dynamics	196
6.1	Momentary and Non-momentary Legal Systems	196
6.2	Promulgation and Derogation of Legal Norms	205
6.3	Two Approaches for Legal Dynamics	214
6.4	Logical Consequences and Legal Dynamics	223
6.5	Logical Consequences and Social Sources	232
	<i>Epilogue</i>	241
	<i>Bibliography</i>	245
	<i>Index</i>	257